Public Spending Code

Quality Assurance Report for 2022



To be submitted to

National Oversight and Audit Commission (NOAC)

May 2023

Certificate

This Annual Quality Assurance Report sets out Wexford County Council's approach to completing the Quality Assurance requirements as set out in the Public Spending Code. It is based on the best financial, organisational and performance related information available across the various areas of responsibility.

Signature of Accounting Officer:

Tom Enright Chief Executive Wexford County Council

Date:

29th May, 2023

•

Introduction

Wexford County Council has completed the Quality Assurance (QA) requirements as set out in the Public Spending Code and the purpose of this report is to present the results of each of the 5 Steps in the QA exercise and to report on compliance with the requirements of the Public Spending Code as established during this exercise.

The Public Spending Code was written specifically with Government Departments in mind and some of the terminology is very specific to that sector. In order to inform the QA exercise for the Local Government Sector a Guidance Note was developed for the sector to assist in providing interpretations from a Local Government perspective.

This guidance note is updated as changes are made to the requirements for the QA exercise. The latest updated guidance note (version 4 - 2021 Revision) has informed the completion of the 2022 report.

Requirements of the Quality Assurance Aspect of the Public Spending Code

The Quality Assurance obligation involves a **5 step** process as follows:

- **Step 1** Drawing up inventories of projects/programmes at the different stages of the Project Life Cycle that have a total Project Life Cost of €500k or more.
- Step 2 Publishing summary information on the organisation's website of all procurements in excess of €10m, related to projects in progress or completed in the year under review. A new project may become a "project in progress" during the year under review if the procurement process is completed and a contract is signed.
- **Step 3** Completing the 7 checklists contained in the PSC. Only one of each checklist per Local Authority is required. Checklists are not required for each project/programme.
- **Step 4** Carrying out a more in-depth check on a small number of selected projects/programmes based on criteria established within the Public Spending Code.
- <u>Step 5</u> Completing a short summary report for the National Oversight and Audit Commission (NOAC).
 This report, which has been generated as a matter of course through compliance with steps 1-4 set out above, is provided to meet the requirement of Step 5.

STEP 1 – Project Inventory

This section presents the project inventories of Wexford County Council for projects with a total life cost in excess of \notin 500,000. The inventory is presented in three stages as set out in the following table which also outlines the Expenditure Category/Band relevant for inclusion in each stage:

Proj	ect/Programme Stage	Category/Band						
1	Expenditure being considered	Capital Projects greater than €0.5m						
		Capital Grant Schemes greater than €0.5m						
		Current Expenditure programme - Increases over €0.5						
2 Expenditure being incurred Capital Projects greater than €0.5m								
		Capital Grant Schemes greater than €0.5m						
		Current Expenditure greater than €0.5m						
3	Expenditure that has recently	Capital Projects greater than €0.5m						
	ended	Capital Grant Schemes greater than €0.5m						
		Current Expenditure greater than €0.5m						

The Project inventory, set out in the format described above, is included in Appendix A. (Appendix A – Inventory of Projects and Programmes over $\notin 0.5m - 2022$)

The Inventory contains **187** Projects under the three stages and comprises a total value of **€780m**. The following table provides an overview of the number of projects under each Project/Programme stage and under each of the categories in each of these stages. It also provides an overview of the Project Costs under each category. There were no items identified under Capital Grant Schemes for 2022.

Project Numbers	Current Expenditure > €0.5m	Capital Expenditure > €0.5m	Totals
Expenditure Being considered	0	75	75
Expenditure Being Incurred	52	48	100
Expenditure recently ended	0	12	12
Totals	52	135	187

Project Total Values	Current Expenditure > €0.5m	Capital Expenditure > €0.5m	Totals
Expenditure Being considered	0	€269m	€269m
Expenditure Being Incurred	€151m	€332m	€483m
Expenditure recently ended	0	€28m	€28m
Totals	€151m	€629m	€780m

STEP 2 - Summary of Procurements in excess of €10m

In compliance with the requirement to publish information on all procurements undertaken by Wexford County Council that were in excess of $\notin 10m$ the following is the location of this publication on the Council's website:

https://www.wexfordcoco.ie/council-and-democracy/procurement-finance-and-creditcontrol/council-spend

The following presents a screen print from the web page:

Comhairle Contae Loch Garman Wexford County Council	I Am Searching For
	Home > Council & Democracy > Procurement, Finance and Cree
	Council Spend
	Public Spending Code - Procurements over €10,000,000
	Procurements over €10m for 2014 - None reported for Wexford County Council for 2014
	Procurements over €10m for 2015 - None reported for Wexford County Council for 2015
	Procurements over €10m for 2016 - None reported for Wexford County Council for 2016
	Procurements over €10m for 2017 - None reported for Wexford County Council for 2017
	Procurements over €10m for 2018 - None reported for Wexford County Council for 2018
	Procurements over €10m for 2019 - None reported for Wexford County Council for 2019
	Procurements over €10m for 2020 - None reported for Wexford County Council for 2020
	Procurements over €10m for 2021 - None reported for Wexford County Council for 2021
	Procurements over €10m for 2022 - None reported for Wexford County Council for 2022
c c	has reported no projects in this category. The requirement m rather than Project Costs. Therefore while the project

inventory reports on 13 projects over €10m, there is currently no single procurement within these

projects that meets the reporting requirement in Step 2 of the QA process.

STEP 3 - Checklists

Step three of the Quality Assurance procedure for the Public Spending Code involves the compilation of a number of checklists. There are 7 checklists in all. Checklists 2, 4 and 6 are capital related checklists while checklists 1, 3, 5 and 7 are Revenue/Current Expenditure related.

The Checklists are informed by the Project Inventory and the following table outlines the approach taken for the completion of the Checklists

Checklist Completion aligned with Project Inventory					
Expenditure Type	Checklist to be completed				
General Obligations	General Obligations - Checklist 1				
A. Expenditure being considered	Capital Projects/Programmes - Checklist 2				
	Current Expenditure – Checklist 3				
B. Expenditure being incurred	Capital Projects/Programmes - Checklist 4				
	Current Expenditure – Checklist 5				
C. Expenditure that has recently ended	Capital Projects/Programmes – Checklist 6				
	Current Expenditure – Checklist 7				

All checklists as outlined above have been completed and can be found in <u>Appendix B</u> of this document.

Findings on Completion of Checklists

While the responses included in the Checklist indicate a satisfactory level of compliance there are indications that there continues to be room for improvements in some areas of business and in certain aspects of the requirements. However, no specific serious issues/concerns were evident during the completion of this element of the QA exercise.

STEP 4 - In-Depth review of a sample number of projects

Step 4 of the Quality Assurance Process involved the examining of a sample selection of projects included on the Project Inventory to test the standard of practices in use and compliance with the Public Spending Code within the organisation.

Internal Audit In-Depth Checks

The Internal Audit Unit of Wexford County Council was assigned the task of completing the Indepth checks. The approach taken was to initially randomly select a number of projects from the inventory having regard to the various stages of the life cycle and the values of project listed and the business area of the local authority in order to have, in as far as possible, a good range of project types and sizes for review.

The In-depth review has been completed and the overview report together with the completed templates setting out the relevant checks for each of the six projects is included in Appendix C of this report.

The selected projects, level of compliance and number of recommendations per project is summarised in the following table:

	Project Reviewed	Compliance	Recommendations
1.	Wexfordia Heritage Park Development Project	Satisfactory	0
2.	Forth Mountain Activity Centre	Satisfactory	0
3.	13 Turnkey Properties at Roxborough Manor, Wexford	Satisfactory	0
4.	20 Turnkey Properties Cluain Beag, Clonard, Wexford	Satisfactory	0
5.	43 Turnkey Properties Ard an Bhile, Healysland, New Ross	Satisfactory	0
6.	Maintenance of LA Housing Units	Limited	2

The formal report on the in-depth review has been submitted to the Management Team within Wexford County Council for consideration. The report including the completed templates is included in Appendix C to this report. The projects examined in the in-depth review have provided satisfactory assurance that there is compliance with the Public Spending Code with the exception of the Housing Maintenance Programme which has been determined to have limited compliance and two recommendations have arisen from the 2022 in-depth review in this business area.

The recommendations from the in-depth review of the Housing Maintenance Programme arose in respect of contract payments examined in the review.

It was noted in this programme, which recorded a spend of $\notin 4.93$ m in 2022, that contracts were generally low in value, and none exceeded $\notin 500$ k. However, some weaknesses were identified in the procurement approach for low value contracts. It was further noted that a review of the procurement approach in the Housing Maintenance area of Wexford County Council was commenced and completed during 2022. This resulted in a revised Procurement Framework being established for the period 2023 to 2026, and revised procedures are now in place for improving procurement in this area going forward.

The recommendations arising from the in-depth review undertaken as part of the PSC Quality Assurance exercise centred on the implementation of supporting documents, policies and procedures being recorded and implemented to ensure compliance with the Public Spending Code. A further recommendation from the review is that the Housing Maintenance Area is revisited again in the 2024 PSC Quality Assurance process to complete a further in-depth review to test and assure management that the changes being implemented are demonstrating compliance with the Public Spending Code.

A formal note of these recommendations has been issued to the Housing Department of Wexford County Council.

Conclusion

This report has set out all the requirements of the Quality Assurance aspect of the Public Spending Code.

- A Project Inventory has been prepared outlining the various projects/programmes capital and current that were being considered, being incurred, or recently completed by Wexford County Council in 2022.
- The relevant publication in relation to procurements over €10m has been placed on Wexford County Council's website.
- The 7 checklists required to be completed under the terms of the Public Spending Code Quality Assurance requirement have been completed and provide reasonable assurance that there is satisfactory compliance with the Public Spending Code. The level of compliance reported would suggest there are elements of the expenditure life cycle that could be improved but nothing of a serious nature was highlighted during this compliance exercise.
- A more in-depth review of a sample of the projects contained in the Project inventory has been completed and further confirmed that there is, in general, satisfactory compliance with the requirements of the Public Spending Code. Six Projects were examined. The project documentation examined provided satisfactory assurance that five of the six projects are in compliance with the Public Spending Code and one project has provided limited assurance in respect of procurements under €500k. Two recommendations were identified in this review and have been communicated to the relevant business area of the Council.
- The final step of the QA exercise, as required under the Public Spending Code, is the compilation and publication of a summary report outlining the Quality Assurance Exercise undertaken by Wexford County Council. The contents of this report provide details of the QA exercise completed. The report has been considered by the Management Team of Wexford County Council and has been certified by the Accounting Officer, Tom Enright, Chief Executive.
- The 2022 final report can be located on Wexford County Council's website at <u>https://www.wexfordcoco.ie/council-and-democracy/procurement-finance-and-credit-control/public-spending-code</u>

Overall, the QA exercise has provided reasonable assurance to the management of Wexford County Council that the requirements of the Public Spending Code are being met.

Appendix A - Inventory of Projects and Programmes Over ${\ensuremath{\in}} 0.5m$ - 2022

Wexford County Council 2022 Inventory of Projects and Programmes over €0.5m

The following contains an inventory of Expenditure on Projects/Programmes with a value above €0.5m, categorised by Expenditure being considered, Expenditure being incurred and Expenditure recently ended. Only projects with Total Project Expenditure matching these criteria are included in the Inventory table

Expenditure being Considered - Greater than €0.5m (Capital and Current)									
Project/Scheme/Programme Name	Short Description	Current Expenditure Amount in Reference Year	Capital Expenditure Amt in Reference Year (Non Grant)	Capital Expenditure Amt in Reference Year (Grant)	Project/Programme Anticipated Timeline	Projected Lifetime Expenditure			
Housing & Building									
60 Units Killeens Wexford	House Construction Project		196,069.00		2023-2025	€17,642,000.00			
Purchase of Land for Housing Purposes	House Construction Project		0.00		2021 -2023	€1,500,000.00			
Bride Street (3 Units)	House Purchase Project		30,735.00		2019 -2023	€1,000,000.00			
Ramsfort Gorey (SSF) (20 Units)	Affordable Housing Project		15,810.00		2021 -2023	€6,000,000.00			
18 Units Tagoat	House Construction Project		10,283.00		2021 -2023	€5,000,000.00			
7 Units Belvedere Road	House Construction Project		0.00		2022 - 2024	€1,400,000.00			
5 Part V Greenhills, Clonhasten	Part V Acquisitions		492.00		2022 - 2024	€1,200,000.00			
8 Turnkey Greenhills, Clonhasten	Turnkey Project		0.00		2022 - 2024	€1,750,000.00			
13 Turnkey Haughton Place	Turnkey Project		0.00		2022 - 2023	€2,500,000.00			
10 Turnkey Clonard	Turnkey Project		0.00		2022-2023	€2,338,000.00			
Monamolin (5 units)	House Construction Project		0.00		2022 - 2023	€1,300,000.00			
Ballygillane (5 units)	House Construction Project		0.00		2022 - 2023	€1,040,000.00			
Grogan's Rd, Wexford (4 units)	House Construction Project		0.00		2022 - 2023	€800,000.00			
Gleann an Ghairdin , Gorey (Ph 3 & 4) 10 units	Part V Acquisitions		0.00		2022 -2023	€2,500,000.00			
Adamstown 2 Units			0.00		2023-2024	€500,000.00			
Road Transportation & Safety									
N25 Maldron Roundabout to Whitford (1.8 Kms)	Road Construction/Strenghtening		0.00		2020-2022	€2,500,000.00			
New Ross Bridge to Kilkenny boundary (0.8 Kms)	Road Construction/Strenghtening		0.00		2020-2022	€500,000.00			
N25 Kilmore Junction to Ashfield Cross (4.6 Kms)	Road Construction/Strenghtening		0.00		2020-2022	€4,300,000.00			
N30 Forestwood to Cloneigh (2.6 Kms)	Road Construction/Strenghtening		0.00		2020-2023	€3,000,000.00			
N80 Scarawalsh to Ballycarney (3.7 Kms)	Road Construction/Strenghtening		0.00		2020-2023	€3,500,000.00			
N25/R733 Duncannon Road Roundabout	Road Construction/Strenghtening		0.00		2022-2023	€1,000,000.00			
Wexford Inner Relief Rd (Clonard to Newtown Rd)	Road Construction/Strenghtening		0.00		2022-2024	€2,500,000.00			
Wexford Inner Relief Road (Ballinagee to R730)	Road Construction/Strenghtening		0.00		2022-2025	€4,000,000.00			
Gorey Inner Relief Road (Creagh to College Road)	Road Construction/Strenghtening		0.00		2022-2026	€6,000,000.00			
N25 Tinnock to Gorey	Road Construction/Strenghtening		0.00		2023-2025	€1,200,000.00			
N25 Whitford Roundabout to Drinagh	Road Construction/Strenghtening		0.00		2023-2025	€5,000,000.00			

Expenditure being Considered - Greater than €0.5m (Capital and Current)								
Project/Scheme/Programme Name	Short Description	Current Expenditure Amount in Reference Year	Capital Expenditure Amt in Reference Year (Non Grant)	Capital Expenditure Amt in Reference Year (Grant)	Project/Programme Anticipated Timeline	Projected Lifetime Expenditure		
Water/Surface Water Projects								
Enniscorthy Minor Flood Scheme	Works at Lyre River/Bishopswell		0.00		2022-2024	€600,000.00		
DPI improvements TIC by Wexford Co Council	Imps to Water/WW in Housing Estates		0.00		2022-2026	€750,000.00		
Environmental Services								
Holmestown Landfill	Temporary & Permanent Capping		0.00		2021-2023	€1,500,000.00		
Rosslare Coastal Protection Works	Coastal Protection Works		0.00		2022-2025	€7,930,000.00		
Active Trails Programme	Slaney Trails Development		0.00		2022-2025	€850,000.00		
Lady's Island Lake - Water Level Management	Drainage Works/Development		0.00		2023-2025	€1,900,000.00		
Fethard Harbour Slipway	Slipway Improvements		0.00		2022-2025	€550,000.00		
New Ross Port Dredging	Feasability Study		0.00		2023-2025	€650,000.00		
New Ross Quayside Pontoon	Upgrade of Quayside Pontoon		0.00		2020-2023	€800,000.00		
Special Projects								
Templeshannon Urban Renewal	Regenaration Project		11,521.00		2022-2024	€6,600,000.00		
Gorey Market House Development	Consolidation and Development of Site		21,771.00		2020-2024	€6,000,000.00		
Greenway (Rosslare Harbour to Waterford)	Greenway project along old railway		0.00		2019 - 2025	€41,000,000.00		
Greenway (Wexford to Rosslare)	Greenway - Wexford town to Rosslare		34,759.00		2019 - 2025	€36,000,000.00		
John's Street Business Hub	Business Hub Development in New Ross		6,787.00		2021 - 2024	€2,310,000.00		
Wexfordia Hook Redevelopment Project	Enhanced Tourist Facility		42,023.00		2021 - 2024	€6,856,645.00		
Wexfordia Heritage Park Development Project	Enhanced Tourist Facility		285,858.00		2021 - 2024	€8,500,000.00		
Esmonde Street Development - Gorey	Public Realm in Esmonde Street, Gorey		17,989.00		2019 - 2023	€2,300,000.00		
Enniscorthy Technology Park Phase 2	Expansion of Technology Park		0.00		2022-2025	€1,000,000.00		
Enniscorthy Tourism Project	Upgrade of Enniscorthy Town Centre		18,207.00		2021 - 2025	€9,630,000.00		
Crescent Quay Dredging	Dredging works in Wexford Town		8,598.00		2021-2023	€1,000,000.00		
Courtown North Beach & Marina	Breakwater and Beach Nourishment		163,551.00		2020 - 2025	€635,000.00		
Oyster Lane Town Block	Public Realm Project		60,479.00		2021-2023	€1,800,000.00		
Enniscorthy North Business District (Phase 2)	Develop Active Travel Network		188,552.00		2022-2024	€3,400,000.00		
Enniscorthy Sports Hub (Phase 2 - Building)	Development of Building at Sports Hub		0.00		2021-2023	€740,000.00		
Curracloe Water Sports Activity Centre	Development of Water Activity Centre		0.00		2021-2024	€1,300,000.00		
Forth Mountain Activity Centre	Development of Activity Centre on site		0.00		2021 - 2024	€7,760,000.00		
Bunclody Publc Realm Project	Public Realm in Main Street Bunclody		0.00		2021-2023	€500,000.00		
St Waleran's Access Road	Access Road to Major development site		0.00		2021-2023	€6,400,000.00		
New Ross Courthouse	Remedial Works		217,893.00		2022-2024	€850,000.00		
Cornmarket/Bullring Renewal	Public Realm Works		0.00		2022-2025	€2,250,000.00		

Expenditure being Considered - Greater than €0.5m (Capital and Current)								
Project/Scheme/Programme Name	Short Description	Current Expenditure Amount in Reference Year	Capital Expenditure Amt in Reference Year (Non Grant)	Capital Expenditure Amt in Reference Year (Grant)	Project/Programme Anticipated Timeline	Projected Lifetime Expenditure		
Adoration Convent	Devel GSU Student Accommodation		0.00		2021-2023	€4,800,000.00		
Castlebridge Urban Renewal	Playground, Car Park & Comm Facilities		0.00		2022-2024	€800,000.00		
E/C Murphy Flood Regeneration Project	Town Centre Regeneration		0.00		2023-2025	€1,274,000.00		
New Ross Quay - Emigrant Park	Public Realm Project		0.00		2023-2024	€1,063,000.00		
Gorey Fire Station	Refurbishment of Fire Station Facilities		0.00		2023-2024	€1,000,000.00		
Duncannon Fort	Enhanced Tourist Facility		0.00		2024-2025	€740,000.00		
Ferndale Gym	Community Support Project		0.00		2023-2025	€1,300,000.00		
Brennan's Lane/Shambles Project	Public Realm Project		0.00		2024-2025	€561,000.00		
Planning/Economic & Development								
Kilmore Quay Business Hub	Business Park in Kilmore Quay		0.00		2023-2025	€1,200,000.00		
St Waleran's Centre of Sports Excellence	New Shared Sports Complex		0.00		2023-2025	€2,250,000.00		
Development of Spawell Road Complex	Development of Business Complex		0.00		2023-2025	€600,000.00		
Recreation & Amenity								
Improvements Enniscorthy Library	Redevelopment of Library facilities		0.00		2022-2025	€3,000,000.00		
Improvements New Ross Library	Redevelopment of Library facilities		0.00		2022-2025	€2,000,000.00		
Mobile Library	Purchase of Vehicle		0.00		2024-2025	€500,000.00		
Archive Storage	Storage Development		0.00		2022-2024	€1,500,000.00		
Courtown Riverchapel Sports Complex Phase 2	Extension of Sports facilities		0.00		2022-2025	€750,000.00		
Wexford Sports Field Project	Joint Development of Amenity Area		0.00		2022-2025	€1,000,000.00		
Bridgetown to Kilmore Quay Trail	Walkway/Cycleway & potential Blueway		7,342.00		2022-2025	€2,000,000.00		
Miscellaneous Services								
Upgrade of CCTV Systems	Upgrade of CCTV Systems in Towns		8,922.00		2020-2023	€500,000.00		
Totals			1,347,641.00			€269,169,645.00		

Expenditure being Incurred - Greater than €0.5m (Capital and Current)								
Project/Scheme/Programme Name	Short Description	Current Expenditure Amt in Reference Year	Capital Expenditure Amount in Reference Year (Non Grant)	Capital Expenditure Amount in Reference Year (Grant)	Project/Programme Anticipated Timeline	Cumulative Expenditure to- date	Projected Lifetime Expenditure (Capital Only)	
Housing & Building								
Glentire (6 Units)	House Construction Project		€160,969.00	€0.00	2019-2022	€1,823,308.00	€1,900,000.00	
Wexford Street Gorey (30 Units)	House Construction Project		€246,605.00	€0.00	2021-2023	€873,928.00	€10,245,000.00	
Wexford Women's Refuge Proposal (12 units)	CAS Housing Units		€236,583.00	€0.00	2021-2023	€631,287.00	€6,458,000.00	
Whiterock (44 Units)	House Construction Project		€2,973,193.00	€0.00	2021-2024	€397,347.00	€10,700,000.00	
Grantstown Voluntary Housing (16 Units)	CAS Housing Units		€0.00	€0.00	2021-2024	€85,985.00	€1,830,000.00	
Ballyhine (7 units)	House Construction Project		€171,470.00	€0.00	2021-2023	€212,242.00	€2,388,000.00	
Rosetown (23 Units) - Phase 1	House Construction Project		€2,716,358.00	€0.00	2021-2023	€4,612,860.00	€5,400,000.00	
Carley's Bridge (17 Units)	House Construction Project		€352,638.00	€0.00	2020-2022	€3,720,457.00	€4,000,000.00	
Creagh (22 units)	House Construction Project		€7,515.00	€0.00	2021-2024	€33,123.00	€5,750,000.00	
Part V Roxborough Manor, Mulgannon Wex (22)	Part V Acquisitions		€1,535,013.00	€0.00	2020-2023	€4,315,902.00	€4,724,000.00	
Rosbercon New Ross (35 Units)	House Construction Project		€18,752.00	€0.00	2021-2023	€225,729.00	€5,500,000.00	
Bullawn New Ross (3 Units) SN	House Construction Project		€0.00	€0.00	2021 - 2023	€38,020.00	€845,000.00	
Circle Hsg CAS Acquisitions	CAS Project		€31,000.00	€0.00	2021-2022	€1,022,605.00	€1,082,479.00	
39 Turnkey Part V Tobar Muire Creagh	Turnkey Project		€22,998.00	€0.00	2021-2022	€2,342,998.00	€9,587,500.00	
4 Part V Tobar Muire Creagh	Part V Acquisitions		€4,582.00	€0.00	2021-2023	€420,518.00	€839,460.00	
13 Turnkey Roxborough Manor	Turnkey Project		€2,235,036.00	€0.00	2021 - 2022	€699,000.00	€2,908,000.00	
11 Part V Springview, Gorey	Part V Acquisitions		€0.00	€0.00	2021 - 2023	€5,228.00	€2,238,000.00	
Castleland, Ferns (20 Units)	Turnkey Project		€5,322,952.00	€0.00	2022 - 2023	€5,322,952.00	€5,460,000.00	
Phase 1 173 Units - St Wallerans, Gorey	House Construction Project		€298,318.00	€0.00	2022-2026	€298,318.00	€10,000,000.00	
Phase 2 - Rosetown 12 Units	House Construction Project		€144,417.00	€0.00	2023 -2024	€144,416.00	€3,385,000.00	
Maintenance of LA Housing	Annual Operational Costs	€7,653,851.00						
Housing Assessment, Allocation & Transfer	Annual Operational Costs	€1,016,178.00						
Housing Rent and TP Administration	Annual Operational Costs	€945,956.00						
Housing Community Development Support	Annual Operational Costs	€587,353.00						
Admin of Homeless Service	Annual Operational Costs	€1,415,563.00						
Support to Housing Capital Programme	Annual Operational Costs	€2,073,347.00						
RAS Programme	Annual Operational Costs	€13,659,976.00						
Housing Loans	Annual Operational Costs	€1,763,316.00						
Housing Grants	Annual Operational Costs	€4,023,807.00						
Housing Assistance Programme	Annual Operational Costs	€504,951.00						

Expenditure being Incurred - Greater than €0.5m (Capital and Current)								
Project/Scheme/Programme Name	Short Description	Current Expenditure Amount in Reference Year	Capital Expenditure Amount in Reference Year (Non Grant)	Capital Expenditure Amount in Reference Year (Grant)	Project/Programme Anticipated Timeline	Cumulative Expenditure to- date	Projected Lifetime Expenditure (Capital Only)	
Road Transportation & Safety	•			. ,				
Public Lighting LED Upgrade Programme	Public Lighting Upgrade		€40,014.00	€0.00	2019-2022	€5,384,879.00	€5,500,000.00	
Rosslare Harbour Access Road	Construction/Strengthening		€442,302.00	€0.00	2020-2026	€754,699.00	€16,000,000.00	
Oylegate - Rosslare Hbr (Design)	Construction/Strengthening		€896,143.00	€0.00	2020-2023	€3,242,193.00	€12,160,000.00	
N25 Ballygillane Roundabout	Construction/Strengthening		€1,335,980.00	€0.00	2020-2022	€1,398,493.00	€2,500,000.00	
New Ross Flood Relief Scheme Phase 3	Flooding Prevention works		€32,388.00	€0.00	2021-2023	€712,661.00	€1,000,000.00	
N11 Ferns Pavement Rehab	Construction/Strengthening		€1,119,820.00	€0.00	2022-2025	€1,368,990.00	€1,400,000.00	
New Ross Destination Towns	Public Realm Project		€247,133.00	€0.00	2022 -2024	€695,116.00	€725,000.00	
NP Roads - Maintenance & Improvement	Annual Operational Costs	€1,607,936.00						
Regional Rds - Maintenance & Improvement	Annual Operational Costs	€3,014,815.00						
Local Roads - Maintenance & Improvement	Annual Operational Costs	€34,990,558.00						
Public Lighting	Annual Operational Costs	€1,964,116.00						
Road Safety Engineering Improvements	Annual Operational Costs	€546,369.00						
Maintenance & Management of Car Parking	Annual Operational Costs	€1,396,566.00						
Agency & Recoupable	Annual Operational Costs	€1,186,684.00						
Water/Surface Water Projects								
Wexford Minor Flood Works (Racecourse)	Flood Relief Works		€22,984.00		2018-2021	€380,543.00	€525,000.00	
CFRAM Wexford Town Flood Relief Scheme	Flooding Prevention works		€96,534.00	€0.00	2021-2029	€323,343.00	€9,000,000.00	
DPI Resolution Multi annual Prog 2021-2024 (Not TIC	Wastewater Impr/Devel		€2,321.00	€0.00	2019-2021	€83,743.00	€2,272,000.00	
Water Supply - Irish Water SLA	Annual Operational Costs	€5,208,789.00						
Waste Water Treatment - Irish Water SLA	Annual Operational Costs	€2,633,799.00						
Operations & Maintenance of Public Conveniences	Annual Operational Costs	€610,201.00						
Admin of Group & Private Installations	Annual Operational Costs	€1,312,111.00						
Support to Irish Water Capital Programme	Annual Operational Costs	€1,028,479.00						
Special Projects								
Wexford Crescent Development	Public Realm Project		€31,160.00	€0.00	2019-2022	€3,146,964.00	€3,200,000.00	
Min Ryan Park, Wexford	Public Park Wexford Town		€81,077.00	€0.00	2018-2022	€5,038,927.00	€5,400,000.00	
Enniscorthy Technology Park Phase 1	Devel of Technology Park		€7,508.00	€0.00	2018-2022	€2,688,597.00	€2,918,600.00	
Greenway (New Ross to Waterford)	Greenway project		€3,857,404.00	€0.00	2019-2024	€8,744,660.00	€32,350,000.00	
Kilmore Quay Relief Road	Link Road Kilmore Quay		€434,098.00	€0.00	2020-2022	€1,405,872.00	€1,470,000.00	

Expenditure being Incurred - Greater than €0.5m (Capital and Current)							
Project/Scheme/Programme Name	Short Description	Current Expenditure Amount in Reference Year	Capital Expenditure Amount in Reference Year (Non Grant)	Capital Expenditure Amount in Reference Year (Grant)	Project/Programme Anticipated Timeline	Cumulative Expenditure to- date	Projected Lifetime Expenditure (Capital Only)
Special Projects (contd)			((0.0.10)			(00)101 011//
Carrigfoyle Activity Park	Development of Trails		€147,835.00	€0.00	2019-2021	€1,416,466.00	€1,500,000.00
Gorey Park Development	Development of Park		€341,835.00	€0.00	2019-2022	€2,952,056.00	€3,105,000.00
Trinity Wharf	Mixed Use Employment		€761,421.00	€0.00	2021-2024	€3,361,647.00	€28,156,000.00
New Ross Tourism Project	Enhanced Tourist Facility		€43,171.00	€0.00	2020 - 2024	€1,740,580.00	€7,800,000.00
High Hill Park New Ross	Development of Public Park		€1,651,779.00	€0.00	2019 - 2022	€2,486,038.00	€2,620,000.00
Wexford Arts Centre	Refurb Works		€2,042,558.00	€0.00	2019 - 2022	€2,741,877.00	€3,202,000.00
New Ross Public Realm	Removal of Oil Tanks		€37,323.00	€0.00	2020 - 2022	€646,018.00	€1,063,000.00
New Ross Fire Station	Development Fire Station		€960,223.00	€0.00	2020 - 2022	€1,715,383.00	€1,805,000.00
Monck Street, Public Realm	Paving, & Streetscape Wks		€943,678.00		2022-2023	€1,046,108.00	€1,300,000.00
Enniscorthy Flood Defence Scheme	Flood Defence Works		€476,363.00	€0.00	2015-2024	€5,721,576.00	€50,700,000.00
Carrigfoyle Activity Park	Development of Trails		€147,835.00	€0.00	2019-2021	€1,416,466.00	€1,500,000.00
Development Management							
SICAP Programme 2018 - 2022	Social Inclusion/Community		€2,162,240.00	€0.00	2018-2022	€13,867,191.00	€18,280,585.00
LEADER programme 2020 - 2024	Grant Programme Extend		€2,370,365.00	€0.00	2020-2024	€10,738,588.00	€12,000,000.00
Forward Planning	Annual Operational Costs	€939,251.00					
Development Management	Annual Operational Costs	€2,253,101.00					
Planning Enforcement	Annual Operational Costs	€1,237,722.00					
Community Function	Annual Operational Costs	€2,634,418.00					
Building Control	Annual Operational Costs	€962,217.00					
Economic Development & Promotion	Annual Operational Costs	€5,811,430.00					
Property Management	Annual Operational Costs	€851,125.00					
Heritage and Conservation Services	Annual Operational Costs	€734,269.00					
Environmental Services							
Coastal Protection Works (Rosslare Strand)	Coastal Protection Works		€595,922.00	€0.00	2020-2024	€719,714.00	€7,930,000.00
Seaview Coastal Protection Works (Kilmore Quay)	Coastal Protection Works		€431,651.00	€0.00	2021-2023	€629,617.00	€700,000.00
Landfill Operation & Aftercare	Annual Operational Costs	€1,717,088.00					
Recovery & Recycling Facilities	Annual Operational Costs	€1,769,026.00					
Litter Management	Annual Operational Costs	€1,088,978.00					
Street Cleaning	Annual Operational Costs	€2,359,823.00					

	Expenditure being	g Incurred - Greater t	han €0.5m (Capita	l and Current)			
Project/Scheme/Programme Name	Short Description	Current Expenditure Amount in Reference Year	Capital Expenditure Amount in Reference Year (Non Grant)	Capital Expenditure Amount in Reference Year (Grant)	Project/Programme Anticipated Timeline	Cumulative Expenditure to- date	Projected Lifetime Expenditure (Capital Only)
Environmental Services (Contd)							
Waste Regulations, Monitoring & Enforcement	Annual Operational Costs	€883,005.00					
Maintenance & Upkeep of Burial Grounds	Annual Operational Costs	€576,916.00					
Safety of Structures & Places	Annual Operational Costs	€1,372,239.00					
Operation of Fire Services	Annual Operational Costs	€5,488,832.00					
Water Quality, Air/Noise Pollution	Annual Operational Costs	€1,156,657.00					
Recreation and Amenity							
Operation of Library & Archive Services	Annual Operational Costs	€5,494,545.00					
Outdoor Lesiure Areas Operations	Annual Operational Costs	€2,291,616.00					
Community, Sport & Recreation Development	Annual Operational Costs	€1,338,113.00					
Operation of Arts Programme	Annual Operational Costs	€2,049,389.00					
Agriculture, Education, Health and Welfare							
Operation & Maintenance of Piers & Harbours	Annual Operational Costs	€1,793,265.00					
Veterinary Services	Annual Operational Costs	€779,548.00					
Miscellaneous Services							
Profit/Loss of Machinery Account	Annual Operational Costs	€753,673.00					
Profit/Loss of Stores Account	Annual Operational Costs	€943,445.00					
Administration of Rates	Annual Operational Costs	€6,352,685.00					
Local Representation/Civic Leadership	Annual Operational Costs	€1,938,385.00					
Motor Taxation	Annual Operational Costs	€1,143,493.00					
Agency & Recoupable Services	Annual Operational Costs	€5,336,749.00					
Totals		€151,195,724.00	€38,091,630.00	€0.00		€112,378,763.00	€331,822,624.00

Projects/	Programmes Completed or discontinu	ed in the reference ye	ear - Greater than €0.	5m (Capital and Curr	rent)	
Project/Scheme/Programme Name	Short Description	Current Expenditure Amount in Reference Year	Capital Expenditure Amount in Reference Year (Non Grant)	Capital Expenditure Amount in Reference Year (Grant)	Project/Programme Completion Date	Final Outturn Expenditure
Housing & Building						
House Purchases 2019/2020 - Wexf District	House Purchases	€0.00	€0.00	€0.00	2022	€2,495,123.00
House Purchase 2019/2020 - Gorey District	House Purchases	€0.00	€0.00	€0.00	2022	€939,296.00
20 Units Cluain Beag Clonard, Wexford	Turnkey Project	€0.00	€1,944,423.00	€0.00	2022	€4,345,200.00
6 Units Cluain Beag Clonard	Part V Acquisitions	€0.00	€368,964.00	€0.00	2022	€1,229,500.00
5 PT V Units - An Glasan E/C	Part V Acquisitions	€0.00	€219,095.00	€0.00	2022	€1,098,834.00
16 Units Ballynaglogh	Turnkey Project	€0.00	€4,019,884.00	€0.00	2022	€4,020,253.00
Ard Uisce (8 units)	Turnkey Project	€0.00	€2,015,325.00	€0.00	2022	€2,015,325.00
Pearsons Brook, Creagh, Gorey(Ph1) 2 units	Part V Acquisitions	€0.00	€512,516.00	€0.00	2022	€512,516.00
43 Turnkeys Ard an Bhile, Healysland N Ross	Turnkey Project	€0.00	€8,599,171.00	€0.00	2022	€8,599,443.00
5 Part V Ard an Bhile, Healysland New Ross	Part V Acquisitions	€0.00	€937,888.00	€0.00	2022	€943,963.00
Energy Refitting Programme 2021	Energy Retrofit Project	€0.00	€1,446,141.00	€0.00	2022	€1,446,141.00
DPAs to Local Authority Houses in 2022	DPA Programme	€0.00	€720,000.00	€0.00	2022	€720,000.00
Totals		€0	€20,783,407.00	€0.00		€28,365,594.00

Appendix B – Checklists of Compliance

PUBLIC SPENDING CODE (PSC)

CHECKLISTS 1 - 7

Checklists in respect of Capital investment are updated to reflect Public Spending Code: A Guide to Evaluating, Planning and Managing Public Investment, December 2019

QA Checklists – Step 3

When completing the checklists, organisations should consider the following points.

- The scoring mechanism for the checklists is a follows:
 - Scope for significant improvements = a score of 1
 - Compliant but with some improvement necessary = a score of 2
 - Broadly compliant = a score of 3
- For some questions, the scoring mechanism is not always strictly relevant. In these cases, it may be appropriate to mark as N/A and provide the required information in the commentary box as appropriate.
- The focus should be on providing descriptive and contextual information to frame the compliance ratings and to address the issues raised for each question. It is also important to provide summary details of key analytical outputs covered in the sample for those questions which address compliance with appraisal / evaluation requirements the annual number of formal evaluations, economic appraisals, project completion reports¹ and ex post evaluations. Key analytical outputs undertaken but outside of the sample should also be noted in the report.

Local Authority Notes

- 1. Capital Grant Schemes relate to Projects (recorded in the capital account) where expenditure relates to payments on the foot of grant applications from individuals/groups to the local authority e.g. Housing Aids for the elderly. It has been agreed with DPER that the Capital Grant Scheme element of the Project Inventory will only be used in exceptional circumstances where a LA commences its own grant scheme or primarily funds such a scheme as all other grant schemes are related to schemes commenced at Departmental level and are to be accounted for in the 'capital programmes' column of the QA inventory. The treatment of Capital Grant Schemes within the Project Inventory can therefore be clarified as follows:
- a. Where a Capital Grant Scheme is 100% funded by Government Grant Project Cost to be included under Capital Programme;
- b. Where a Capital Grant Scheme is 100% funded by the Local Authority Project Cost to be included under Capital Grant Scheme;
- c. Where a Capital Grant Scheme is primarily funded by Government Grant with an element of local funding Project Cost to be included under Capital Programme with a note made for each element funded by own resources e.g. Includes 20% local funding;
- d. Where a Capital Grant Scheme is primarily funded by Local Funding with an element of government grant funding Project Cost is to be recorded under Capital Grant Scheme with a note made for each element funded by government grant, e.g. Includes 40% government grant funding.
- 2. As noted in the general guidance above there may be questions where the scoring mechanism or indeed the question itself are not relevant to some or all local authorities. In such case it is acceptable to mark the answer as N/A and include commentary, where appropriate.

¹ Project completion reports (previously called post project reviews) – see Department of Public Expenditure & Reform, Circular 06/2018 available <u>here</u>

Checklist 1 – To be completed in respect of general obligations not specific to individual projects/programmes.

	General Obligations not specific to individual projects/programmes.	Self- Assessed Compliance Rating: 1 - 3	Comment/Action Required
Q 1.1	Does the organisation ensure, on an ongoing basis, that appropriate people within the organisation and its agencies are aware of their requirements under the Public Spending Code (incl. through training)?	3	All relevant staff & agencies have been notified of their obligations under the PSC
Q 1.2	Has internal training on the Public Spending Code been provided to relevant staff?	2	As training is rolled out within the sector it is expected that WCC staff will engage with this training
Q 1.3	Has the Public Spending Code been adapted for the type of project/programme that your organisation is responsible for, i.e., have adapted sectoral guidelines been developed?	3	Yes. A guidance document has been developed for the QA adapting the PSC to Local Government structures and approach.
Q 1.4	Has the organisation in its role as Approving Authority satisfied itself that agencies that it funds comply with the Public Spending Code?	N/A	No project relevant to the PSC
Q 1.5	Have recommendations from previous QA reports (incl. spot checks) been disseminated, where appropriate, within the organisation and to agencies?	3	
Q 1.6	Have recommendations from previous QA reports been acted upon?	3	Yes
Q 1.7	Has an annual Public Spending Code QA report been submitted to and certified by the Chief Executive Officer, submitted to NOAC and published on the Local Authority's website?	3	Yes
Q 1.8	Was the required sample of projects/programmes subjected to in-depth checking as per step 4 of the QAP?	3	Yes
Q 1.9	Is there a process in place to plan for ex post evaluations? Ex-post evaluation is conducted after a certain period has passed since the completion of a target project with emphasis on the effectiveness and sustainability of the project.	2	If and where appropriate
Q 1.10	How many formal evaluations were completed in the year under review? Have they been published in a timely manner?	3 (No)	3 Post Projects reviews completed
Q 1.11	Is there a process in place to follow up on the recommendations of previous evaluations?	2	
Q 1.12	How have the recommendations of reviews and ex post evaluations informed resource allocation decisions?	2	If and where appropriate

Checklist 2 – To be completed in respect of capital projects/programmes & capital grant schemes that were under consideration in the past year.

	Capital Expenditure being Considered – Appraisal and Approval	Self- Assessed Compliance Rating: 1 - 3	Comment/Action Required
Q 2.1	Was a Strategic Assessment Report (SAR) completed for all capital projects and programmes over €10m?	3	
Q 2.2	Were performance indicators specified for each project/programme which will allow for a robust evaluation at a later date? Have steps been put in place to gather performance indicator data?	3	
Q 2.3	Was a Preliminary and Final Business Case, including appropriate financial and economic appraisal, completed for all capital projects and programmes?	3	
Q 2.4	Were the proposal objectives SMART and aligned with Government policy including National Planning Framework, Climate Mitigation Plan etc?		
Q 2.5	Was an appropriate appraisal method and parameters used in respect of capital projects or capital programmes/grant schemes?		
Q 2.6	Was a financial appraisal carried out on all proposals and was there appropriate consideration of affordability?	3	
Q 2.7	Was the appraisal process commenced at an early enough stage to inform decision making?	3	
Q 2.8	Were sufficient options analysed in the business case for each capital proposal?	3	
Q 2.9	Was the evidence base for the estimated cost set out in each business case? Was an appropriate methodology used to estimate the cost? Were appropriate budget contingencies put in place?	3 3 3	
Q 2.10	Was risk considered and a risk mitigation strategy commenced? Was appropriate consideration given to governance and deliverability?	3	
Q 2.11	Were the Strategic Assessment Report, Preliminary & Final Business Case submitted to DPER for technical review for projects estimated to cost over €100m?	N/A in 2022	No projects of this value
Q 2.12	Was a detailed project brief including design brief and procurement strategy prepared for all investment projects?	3	
Q 2.13	Were procurement rules (both National and EU) complied with?	3	
Q 2.14	Was the Capital Works Management Framework (CWMF) properly implemented?	3	
Q 2.15	Were State Aid rules checked for all support?	N/A	
Q 2.16	Was approval sought from the Approving Authority at all decision gates?	3	
Q 2.17	Was Value for Money assessed and confirmed at each decision gate by Sponsoring Agency and Approving Authority?	3	
Q 2.18	Was approval sought from Government through a Memorandum for Government at the appropriate decision gates for projects estimated to cost over €100m? See Note 2 in the opening auidelines in relation to the interpretation of Capital	N/A	No Project of this value

See Note 2 in the opening guidelines in relation to the interpretation of Capital Grant Schemes in the context of Local Government

Checklist 3 – To be completed in respect of new current expenditure under consideration in the past year.

	Current Expenditure being Considered – Appraisal and Approval	Self- Assessed Compliance Rating: 1 - 3	Comment/Action Required
Q 3.1	Were objectives clearly set out?	3	Outlined to Members of Council as part of the budget process
Q 3.2	Are objectives measurable in quantitative terms?		To an extent
Q 3.3	Was a business case, incorporating financial and economic appraisal, prepared for new current expenditure proposals?	N/A	No new expenditure
Q 3.4	Was an appropriate appraisal method used?	N/A	No new expenditure
Q 3.5	Was an economic appraisal completed for all projects/programmes exceeding €20m or an annual spend of €5m over 4 years?	N/A	No new Projects/Programmes of this level
Q 3.6	Did the business case include a section on piloting?	N/A	
Q 3.7	Were pilots undertaken for new current spending proposals involving total expenditure of at least €20m over the proposed duration of the programme and a minimum annual expenditure of €5m?	N/A	
Q 3.8	Have the methodology and data collection requirements for the pilot been agreed at the outset of the scheme?	N/A	
Q 3.9	Was the pilot formally evaluated and submitted for approval to the relevant Vote Section in DPER?	N/A	
Q 3.10	Has an assessment of likely demand for the new scheme/scheme extension been estimated based on empirical evidence?	N/A	
Q 3.11	Was the required approval granted?	N/A	
Q 3.12	Has a sunset clause been set?	N/A	
Q 3.13	If outsourcing was involved were both EU and National procurement rules complied with?	N/A	
Q 3.14	Were performance indicators specified for each new current expenditure proposal or expansion of existing current expenditure programme which will allow for a robust evaluation at a later date?	N/A	
Q 3.15	Have steps been put in place to gather performance indicator data?	3	

Checklist 4 – To be completed in respect of capital projects/programmes & capital grants schemes incurring expenditure in the year under review.

	Incurring Capital Expenditure	Self-Assessed	Compliance	Rating: 1 - 3	Comment/Action Required				
Q 4.1	Was a contract signed and was it in line with the Approval given at each Decision Gate?		3		Yes, where appropriate				
Q 4.2	Did management boards/steering committees meet regularly as agreed?		3		Yes, where appropriate				
Q 4.3	Were programme co-ordinators appointed to co-ordinate implementation?		3		Internal co-ordinating team in most cases				
Q 4.4	Were project managers, responsible for delivery, appointed and were the project managers at a suitably senior level for the scale of the project?		3		3		3		Internal co-ordinating team in most cases
Q 4.5	Were monitoring reports prepared regularly, showing implementation against plan, budget, timescales and quality?	3			Progress reports were prepared in most cases				
Q 4.6	Did projects/programmes/grant schemes keep within their financial budget and time schedule?		2		2		2 In most cases		In most cases
Q 4.7	Did budgets have to be adjusted?	١	Yes		Yes, up and down				
Q 4.8	Were decisions on changes to budgets / time schedules made promptly?		3		Yes, in most cases				
Q 4.9	Did circumstances ever warrant questioning the viability of the project/programme/grant scheme and the business case (exceeding budget, lack of progress, changes in the environment, new evidence, etc.)?		No		All feasibility exercises completed at the consideration stage of projects				
Q 4.10	If circumstances did warrant questioning the viability of a project/programme/grant scheme was the project subjected to adequate examination?	M	N/A						
Q 4.11	If costs increased or there were other significant changes to the project was approval received from the Approving Authority?		3		This would be a requirement for grant approval				
Q 4.12	Were any projects/programmes/grant schemes terminated because of deviations from the plan, the budget or because circumstances in the environment changed the need for the investment?		No						

See Note 2 in the opening guidelines in relation to the interpretation of Capital Grant Schemes in the context of Local Government

Checklist 5 – To be completed in respect of current expenditure programmes incurring expenditure in the year under review.

	Incurring Current Expenditure	Self-Assessed Compliance Rating: 1 - 3	Comment/Action Required
Q 5.1	Are there clear objectives for all areas of current expenditure?	3	Yes, as part of the budget process
Q 5.2	Are outputs well defined?	3	National KPIs are in place for local government
Q 5.3	Are outputs quantified on a regular basis?	3	KPIs are established each year for specific services
Q 5.4	Is there a method for monitoring efficiency on an ongoing basis?	3	Yes, budget performance monitoring is in place
Q 5.5	Are outcomes well defined?	3	Annual Services Plans and SMDWs
Q 5.6	Are outcomes quantified on a regular basis?	3	Annual Services Plans and SMDWs
Q 5.7	Are unit costings compiled for performance monitoring?	3	National KPIs are in place for local government
Q 5.8	Are other data complied to monitor performance?	3	Yes, budget performance monitoring is in place
Q 5.9	Is there a method for monitoring effectiveness on an ongoing basis?	3	Yes, budget performance monitoring is in place
Q 5.10	Has the organisation engaged in any other 'evaluation proofing' of programmes/projects?	2	If and when appropriate

Checklist 6 – To be completed in respect of capital projects/programmes & capital grant schemes discontinued in the year under review.

	Capital Expenditure Recently Completed	Self-Assessed Compliance Rating: 1 - 3	Comment/Action Required
Q 6.1	How many Project Completion Reports were completed in the year under review?	3 (No)	Housing Projects
Q 6.2	Were lessons learned from Project Completion Reports incorporated into sectoral guidance and disseminated within the Sponsoring Agency and the Approving Authority?	3	
Q 6.3	How many Project Completion Reports were published in the year under review?	3(No)	Housing Project
Q 6.4	How many Ex-Post Evaluations were completed in the year under review?	3 (No)	Housing projects
Q 6.5	How many Ex-Post Evaluations were published in the year under review?	0	
Q 6.6	Were lessons learned from Ex-Post Evaluation reports incorporated into sectoral guidance and disseminated within the Sponsoring Agency and the Approving Authority?	2	Circulated inhouse and notified to DHLGH where relevant
Q 6.7	Were Project Completion Reports and Ex-Post Evaluations carried out by staffing resources independent of project implementation?	No	
Q 6.8	Were Project Completion Reports and Ex-Post Evaluation Reports for projects over €50m sent to DPER for dissemination?	N/A in 2022	No projects of this value in 2022.

See Note 2 in the opening guidelines in relation to the interpretation of Capital Grant Schemes in the context of Local Government

Checklist 7 – To be completed in respect of current expenditure programmes that reached the end of their planned timeframe during the year or were discontinued.

	Current Expenditure that (i) reached the end of its planned timeframe or (ii) was discontinued	Self-Assessed Compliance Rating: 1 - 3	Comment/Action Required
Q 7.1	Were reviews carried out of current expenditure programmes that matured during the year or were discontinued?	N/A	No programme relevant to PSC in 2022
Q 7.2	Did those reviews reach conclusions on whether the programmes were efficient?	N/A	No programme relevant to PSC in 2022
Q 7.3	Did those reviews reach conclusions on whether the programmes were effective?	N/A	No programme relevant to PSC in 2022
Q 7.4	Have the conclusions reached been taken into account in related areas of expenditure?	N/A	No programme relevant to PSC in 2022
Q 7.5	Were any programmes discontinued following a review of a current expenditure programme?	N/A	No programme relevant to PSC in 2022
Q 7.6	Were reviews carried out by staffing resources independent of project implementation?	N/A	No programme relevant to PSC in 2022
Q 7.7	Were changes made to the organisation's practices in light of lessons learned from reviews?	N/A	No programme relevant to PSC in 2022

Appendix C - Step 4 In-depth Review

WEXFORD COUNTY COUNCIL

Public Spending Code Quality Assurance Step 4 Review 2022

Internal Audit Department May 2023



SECTION 1: INTRODUCTION AND BACKGROUND

1.1 INTRODUCTION AND BACKGROUND

- 1.1.1 In accordance with Circular 13/13 "The Public Spending Code: Expenditure Planning, Appraisal & Evaluation in the Irish Public Service – Standard Rules & Procedures" this review was completed on behalf of the Accounting Officer (Chief Executive) as part of the Quality Assurance element of the Public Spending Code (PSC).
- 1.1.2 In line with the Quality Assurance requirements a Project Inventory was drawn up by Wexford County Council's PSC coordinator. The purpose of this inventory was to identify all projects/programmes of Wexford County Council which were at different stages of the Project Life Cycle during the 2022 financial year and where the total project value exceeded €0.5m. This review will focus on the projects included in this inventory.
- 1.1.3 Step 3 of the Quality Assurance exercise involved the completion of high-level checklists that capture various areas of compliance.
- 1.1.4 Step 4, which is the basis of this review report, involves the selection of projects for an in-depth review of compliance with the planning, appraisal, and evaluation requirements of the PSC. The value of capital projects selected for in depth review should be at least 5% of the total value of all capital projects on the project inventory and, the value of revenue projects selected for in depth review should be 1% of the total value of revenue projects on the project inventory. This minimum is an average calculated over a three-year period.
- 1.1.5 Six projects at various stages of the project life cycle were selected for in-depth review, to assess the level of compliance with the Public Spending Code through a more detailed analysis. The project inventory, including details of the selected projects, is attached in Appendix A of this report.

1.1.6	6 Details of the projects chosen are shown in Tab	le 1.1 below
-------	---	--------------

Table 1.1 – Projects selected for In Depth Review								
No.	Section	Project	Cap/Rev	Stage	Value €M			
1.	Special Projects	Wexfordia Heritage Park Development Project	Capital	Being Considered	8.50M			
2.	Special Projects	Forth Mountain Activity Centre	Capital	Being Considered	7.76M			
3.	Housing	13 Turnkey Properties at Roxborough Manor, Mulgannon, Wexford	Capital	Being Incurred	2.90M			
4.	Housing	20 Turnkey Properties Cluain Beag Clonard, Wexford	Capital	Completed	4.34M			
5.	Housing	43 Turnkey Properties Ard an Bhile, Healysland, New Ross	Capital	Completed	8.59M			
6.	Housing	Maintenance of LA Housing Units	Revenue	Being Incurred	4.93M			
Total					€37.02M			

1.2 PURPOSE, OBJECTIVES & SCOPE

- 1.2.1 The objectives of this review were as follows:
 - To provide an independent professional opinion on compliance with the Public Spending Code and more specifically, the quality of the appraisal, planning and implementation of work done within each programme. The projects were examined to assess if the practices implemented are of a high standard.
 - The scope of the audit included a review of compliance with the Public Spending Code within each of the selected projects.
 - Projects selected for in depth review comprise a representative sample from Projects at different stages of the life cycle. Priority was given to projects which were potentially higher risk. The value of capital projects selected for in depth review should be at least 5% of the total value of all capital projects on the project inventory and the value of revenue projects selected for in depth review should be 1% of the total value of revenue projects on the projects on the project inventory. This minimum is an average calculated over a three-year period. The total value of all projects selected in respect of 2014 to 2022 and the average percentages over a three-year period are shown in table 1.2 below.

	INVENTORY	INVENTORY	INVENTORY	SELECTED	SELECTED	%	%	AVG. %	AVG. % 3
YEAR	VALUE	VALUE	VALUE	PROJS.	PROJECTS	SELECTED	SELECTED	3 YRS	YEARS
	CAPITAL	REVENUE	TOTAL	CAPITAL	REVENUE	CAPITAL	REVENUE	CAPITAL	REVENUE
	(€m)	(€m)	(€m)	(€m)	(€m)	(€m)	(€m)	(€m)	(€m)
2014	€100.10	€100.60	€200.70	€11.70	€0.00	11.69%	0%		
2015	€127.31	€97.27	€224.58	€50.67	€0.00	39.80%	0%		
2016	€208.75	€95.96	€304.71	€13.00	€6.03	6.23%	6.28%	19.24%	2.09%
2017	€339.90	€101.97	€441.87	€2.00	€1.40	0.59%	1.37%	15.54%	2.55%
2018	€406.04	€110.60	€516.64	€12.30	€0.00	3.03%	0.00%	3.28%	2.55%
2019	€528.26	€113.10	€641.36	€34.39	€0.00	6.51%	0.00%	3.38%	0.46%
2020	€550.45	€170.34	€720.79	€32.43	€9.28	5.89%	5.45%	5.14%	1.82%
2021	€566.75	€146.95	€713.70	€29.95	€2.99	5.28%	2.03%	5.89%	2.49%
2022	€629.36	€151.20	€780.55	€32.11	€4.93	5.10%	3.26%	5.42%	3.58%

1.3 ASSURANCE

- 1.3.1 Given the outcome of the various reviews set out in table 1.3 below, it is our opinion that in general there is satisfactory compliance with the Public Spending Code within Wexford County Council.
- 1.3.2 The following table summarises the results of our work. The quality assurance in-depth checks for each selected project are included in Appendices 1 to 6 of this report.

Table 1.3 – Compliance Levels						
	Project Reviewed	Compliance	Total Recommendations	Appendix No.		
1.	Wexfordia Heritage Park Development Project	Satisfactory	0	Appendix C1		
2.	Forth Mountain Activity Centre	Satisfactory	0	Appendix C2		
3.	13 Turnkey Properties at Roxborough Manor, Mulgannon, Wexford	Satisfactory	0	Appendix C3		
4.	20 Turnkey Properties Cluain Beag Clonard, Wexford	Satisfactory	0	Appendix C4		
5.	43 Turnkey Properties Ard an Bhile, Healysland, New Ross	Satisfactory	0	Appendix C5		
6.	Maintenance of LA Housing Units	Limited	2	Appendix C6		

APPENDIX C1 – WEXFORDIA HERITAGE PARK DEVELOPMENT PROJECT

Quality Assurance – In Depth Check

Section A: Introduction

This introductory section details the headline information on the programme or project in question.

Programme or Project Information		
Name	Wexfordia Heritage Park Development Project	
Detail	Create a Viking visitor experience at the Irish National Heritage Park, Wexford	
Responsible Body	Wexford County Council	
Current Status	Expenditure being considered	
Start Date	2018	
End Date	N/A	
Overall Cost	€8.5M	

Project Description

Wexford County Council is collaborating with Fáilte Ireland to create a new world-class, immersive Viking visitor experience at the Irish National Heritage Park, Wexford. Operating under the working title of **'Vykingar – Beyond Legend'** the proposal involves the construction of a full-scale Viking town and harbour, along the shores of the river Slaney, directly abutting the very successful Irish National Heritage Park and constituting a major expansion of the park. This project will be developed specifically to target the overseas market and transform

Co. Wexford and the wider South East region into an international tourism destination, with all the associated economic and social dividends.

WEXFORDIA is a county wide development initiative to drive rural regeneration and growth in Wexford. The Irish National Heritage Park (INHP) is one of a cluster of tourism attractions in Co. Wexford recommended for development, along with the Hook Lighthouse Project and the New Ross Tourism Transformation Project.

Section B - Step 1: Logic Model Mapping

As part of this In-Depth Check, Internal Audit, Wexford County Council, have completed a Programme Logic Model (PLM) for the **Wexfordia Heritage Park Development Project**. A PLM is a standard evaluation tool and further information on their nature is available in the <u>Public Spending Code</u>.

Objectives	Inputs	Activities	Outputs	Outcomes
 Develop an authentic Viking experience to expand on and complement the existing INHP offering 	 Estimated project cost of €8.5M Funding from Rural Regeneration and Development Fund (RRDF) 	 RRDF Application submitted for Category 2 funding INHP Project Steering Group established 	 Approval for RRDF Category 2 funding Tourism & Environmental design teams appointed 	 The provision of a new attraction called 'Vykingar – Beyond Legend'
 Develop an attraction of international class and scale to attract 150,000+ visitors per annum Governance Review 	 Funding provided by Wexford County Council & Fáilte Ireland External consultants providing design & construction related consultancy services 	 Preliminary Project Appraisal Tenders for Tourism & Environmental design teams 	 Consultants appointed to conduct Governance Review Master Plan Concept Report Surveys 	

Description of Programme Logic Model

Objectives: The main objective of the project is to develop an authentic Viking experience to expand on and complement the existing Irish National Heritage Park offering. The proposal involves the construction of a full-scale Viking town and harbour, with Viking longboats patrolling the waters of the Slaney estuary, ferrying visitors via water taxi upriver directly from Wexford Quays to land at the new town. The proposal also includes the creation of major visitor spectacles such as full-scale performance of Viking raids and scenes from Viking sagas, as well as regular Viking Age feasts in the evening.

The development of an attraction of international class and scale will attract 150,000+ visitors per annum and will enhance Wexford's tourism offering.

A review of the best governance and operational arrangements for a cluster of heritage tourist attractions in Co. Wexford, including the Irish National Heritage Park, was conducted.

Inputs: The primary input to the project is the estimated project cost of €8.5M.

The Department of Rural and Community Development have confirmed Category 2 funding from the Rural Regeneration and Development Fund (RRDF), for an amount of €543,500, for stages (i) to (iii) 'Shovel Ready Costs'. Category 2 funding allows for project development up to tender stage for the necessary capital works. Wexford County Council (WCC) and Fáilte Ireland will co-fund the balance of €629,882 required for stages (i) to (iii) 'Shovel Ready Costs'.

The estimated costs for stages (iv) to (v) 'Construction Works Costs' are €7,326,618. WCC is required to submit a Second Stage Approval form to the Department of Rural and Community Development for RRDF Category 1 funding, for an amount of €5,494,964. WCC and Fáilte Ireland will co-fund the balance of €1,831,654 required for stages (iv) to (v) 'Construction Works Costs'.

WCC procured consultants to provide Tourism & Related Services and Environmental, Planning, Traffic & Marine Services.

Activities: There are a number of activities carried out to date including:

WCC submitted a Rural Regeneration and Development Fund Application to the Department of Rural and Community Development, for Category 2 funding for feasibility study and development of the Wexfordia Heritage Park Development Project.

The INHP Project Steering Group was established and included stakeholders from WCC, Fáilte Ireland and the INHP.

A preliminary appraisal of the project was carried out by WCC, examining the feasibility of constructing a Viking Village at the INHP.

Tender requests were published by WCC for Tourism & Related Services and Traffic, Environmental, Planning & Marine Services.

Outputs: The Department of Rural and Community Development confirmed Category 2 funding of €543,500, for the project to proceed to tender for the necessary capital works.

Gillespies LLP consultants were appointed to provide Tourism & Related Services up to 'Shovel Ready' stage for the development of the Vykingar Village project.

Roughan & O'Donovan Consulting Engineers were appointed to provide Traffic, Environmental, Planning & Marine Services up to planning submission stage for the development of the Vykingar Village project.

First Western Training Ltd were appointed to procure consultants to conduct the Wexford Attractions Governance Review.

The Irish National Heritage Park and Vykingar Village Master Plan Concept Report was finalised.

A number of surveys were carried out including:

- Traffic Survey
- Bathymetric Survey
- UAV Survey
- Wintering Bird Survey

Outcomes: The envisaged outcome of the project is the provision of a new attraction called 'Vykingar – Beyond Legend'.

Section B - Step 2: Summary Timeline of Project/Programme

The following section tracks the **Wexfordia Heritage Park Development Project** from inception to conclusion in terms of major project/programme milestones.

Sept 2018	Rural Regeneration and Development Fund Application with detailed vision document
May 2019	Provisional Approval & Letter of Offer for RRDF funding from the Department of Rural and Community Development
Oct 2019	Fáilte Ireland Workshops – Planning for excellence in Visitor Attractions & Planning for Successful Revenue Generation
Oct 2019	Tender advertised on eTenders and OJEU for Tourism & Related Services
Nov 2019	Response deadline for submission of tenders for Tourism & Related Services
Feb 2020	Tender assessment for Tourism & Related Services
Feb 2020	Tender advertised on eTenders and OJEU for Traffic, Environmental, Planning & Marine Services
Mar 2020	Response deadline for submission of tenders for Traffic, Environmental, Planning & Marine Services
Jan 2021	Project Execution Plan approved
Feb 2021	Quotation of First Western Training Ltd accepted to procure the services of a consultant to conduct the Wexford Attractions Governance Review

Tender of Gillespies LLP accepted to provide Tourism & Related Services
RRDF Partnership Agreement signed by Fáilte Ireland & Wexford County Council
Tender of Roughan & O'Donovan accepted to provide Traffic, Environmental, Planning & Marine Services
INHP and Vykingar Village: Master Plan Concept Report & Vykingar Shore Concept Report finalised
Presentation to INHP Board
Representatives from the project steering group & Gillespies LLP take part in a Learning Journey to Denmark

Section B - Step 3: Analysis of Key Documents

The following section reviews the key documentation relating to appraisal, analysis and evaluation for the **Wexfordia Heritage Park Development Project.**

Project/Programme Key Documents		
Title	Details	
Rural Regeneration and Development Fund Application Form	Application for RRDF funding for Wexfordia Heritage Park Development Project	
Provisional Approval and Letter of Offer	Funding offer from the Department of Rural and Community Development	
Primary Project Appraisal	Appraisal of Wexfordia Heritage Park Development Project	
Project Execution Plan	Project Execution Plan approved 11 th January 2021	
Tender documents for Tourism & Related Services	Tender documents for the procurement of a consultant to provide Tourism & Related Services	
Tender Assessment Workbook	Assessment of tenders received for the provision of Tourism & Related Services	
Executive Order No. 165/2022	Accept tender of Gillespies LLP for Tourism & Related Services up to 'Shovel Ready' stage for the development of the Vykingar Village at the INHP	
Tender documents for Traffic, Environmental, Planning & Marine Services	Tender documents for the procurement of a consultant to provide Traffic, Environmental, Planning & Marine Services	

Executive Order No. 363/2022	Appointment of Roughan & O'Donovan Consulting Engineers, to provide Traffic, Environmental, Planning & Marine Services up to planning submission stage for the development of the Vykingar Village at the INHP	
Executive Order No. 98/2021	Accept tender of First Western Training Ltd to procure the services of a consultant to conduct the Wexford Attractions Governance Review	
Wexford Heritage Attractions Review – Final Report	Advice on best governance and operating model for a cluster of tourist attractions in Co. Wexford	
Cost Plan RIBA Stage 2 for INHP & Vykingar Village/Gillespies LLP (Draft)	Total project cost estimate for the Vykingar Village development at the INHP	
INHP & Vykingar Shore: Final Vykingar Shore Concept Report	Final Vykingar Shore Concept Report for the Vykingar Village development at the INHP	
INHP & Vykingar Village: Master Plan Concept Report	Final INHP & Vykingar Village Master Plan Concept Report for the Vykingar Village development at the INHP	
Vykingar Market & Economic Feasibility Assessment Draft Report	Assessment of market and demand potential for the Vykingar Village development at the INHP	
RRDF Partnership Agreement - Fáilte Ireland & Wexford County Council	RRDF Partnership Agreement for the 3 Wexfordia Transformational Projects	
Funding Drawdown Requests	Funding Drawdown Requests to the Department of Rural and Community Development in December 2021 and October 2022	
Miscellaneous Debtors Invoice No. 0000040649	Grant Claim No. 1 for 2022 to Fáilte Ireland dated 6 th December 2022	

Key Document 1: Rural Regeneration and Development Fund Application Form

On 26th September 2018, WCC applied to the Department of Rural and Community Development for Category 2 RRDF funding, for the development of the Vykingar Village at the INHP. A detailed vision document formed part of the application.

Key Document 2: Provisional Approval and Letter of Offer

On 17th May 2019, the Department of Rural and Community Development confirmed Category 2 RRDF funding of €543,500, for the first stage of the development of the Vykingar Village at the INHP.

Key Document 3: Primary Project Appraisal

In January 2021, WCC carried out an appraisal of the Wexfordia Heritage Park Development Project. The report outlined the project context, alternative options, cost & funding, value for money appraisal, risk assessment and conclusion.

Key Document 4: Project Execution Plan

The Project Execution Plan, approved on 11th January 2021 details the Project Brief, Project Phase, Project Development & Implementation Approach, Programme Milestones, Project Cost and Funding Certification.

Key Document 5: Tender Documents for Tourism & Related Services

Tender documents for the procurement of a consultant to provide Tourism & Related Services for the development of the Vykingar Village at the INHP.

Key Document 6: Tender Assessment Workbook

Two tenders were received for the provision of Tourism & Related Services for the development of the Vykingar Village at the INHP. Tenders were assessed in accordance with Capital Works Management Framework guidelines and Instructions to Tenderers.

Key Document 7: Executive Order No. 165/2022

The tender of Gillespies LLP was accepted for the provision of Tourism & Related Services up to 'Shovel Ready' stage for the development of the Vykingar Village at the INHP. The Executive Order was signed on 24th February 2022.

Key Document 8: Tender Documents for Traffic, Environmental, Planning & Marine Services

Tender documents for the procurement of a consultant to provide Traffic, Environmental, Planning & Marine Services for the development of the Vykingar Village at the INHP.

Key Document 9: Executive Order No. 363/2022

Roughan & O'Donovan Consulting Engineers were appointed to provide Traffic, Environmental, Planning & Marine Services up to planning submission stage for the development of the Vykingar Village at the INHP. The Executive Order was signed on 19th April 2022.

Key Document 10: Executive Order No. 98/2021

First Western Training Ltd were appointed on behalf of Fáilte Ireland and WCC to procure the services of a consultant to conduct the Wexford Attractions Governance Review. The Executive Order was signed on 22nd February 2021.

Key Document 11: Wexford Heritage Attractions Review – Final Report

Final Report by BOP Consulting for Fáilte Ireland and WCC dated 28th October 2021, advising on the best governance and operating model for a cluster of tourist attractions in Co. Wexford.

Key Document 12: Cost Plan RIBA Stage 2 for Irish National Heritage Park & Vykingar Village/Gillespies LLP (Draft)

Draft report (April 2022) by Sum Ltd (sub-consultant appointed by Gillespies LLP), detailing the total project cost estimate for the Vykingar Village development at the INHP.

Key Document 13: INHP & Vykingar Shore – Final Vykingar Shore Concept Report

Final Vykingar Shore Concept Report (May 2022) by Gillespies LLP for the Vykingar Village development at the INHP.

Key Document 14: INHP & Vykingar Village – Master Plan Concept Report

Final Master Plan Concept Report (May 2022) by Tandem (sub-consultant appointed by Gillespies LLP), for the Vykingar Village development at the INHP.

Key Document 15: Vykingar Market & Economic Feasibility Assessment Draft Report

Draft Report (September 2022) by D & J International Consulting (sub-consultant appointed by Gillespies LLP), assessing the market and demand potential for the Vykingar Village development at the INHP.

Key Document 16: RRDF Partnership Agreement – Fáilte Ireland & Wexford County Council

Agreement signed by Fáilte Ireland on 14th December 2021 and WCC on 11th February 2022, following successful grant application for RRDF funding for the 3 Wexfordia Transformational Projects.

Key Document 17: Funding Drawdown Requests

The first funding drawdown request was made to the Department of Rural and Community Development on 2^{nd} December 2021 for $\leq 44,531.24$ (Payment received by WCC on 20^{th} December 2021). The second funding drawdown request was made on 12^{th} October 2022 for $\leq 203,275.77$ (Payment received by WCC on 20^{th} October 2022). (Total expenditure incurred by WCC to 31^{st} December 2022 is $\leq 363,770.81$.)

Key Document 18: Miscellaneous Debtors Invoice No. 0000040649

WCC received a payment of €23,656.46 from Fáilte Ireland on 6th December 2022, in respect of funding claim no. 1 for the INHP project.

Section B - Step 4: Data Audit

The following section details the data audit that was carried out for the **Wexfordia Heritage Park Development Project**. It evaluates whether appropriate data is available for the future evaluation of the project/programme.

Data Required	Use	Availability
Application for RRDF Category 2 funding	Summary & appraisal of proposal including key milestones & project rationale	Available on Project File
Approval for RRDF Category 2 funding	Department confirmation of funding to allow project to proceed	Available on Project File
Tender reports & Executive Orders appointing consultants	Provides evidence of procurement for services & approval for appointments	Available on Project File
Presentations & progress reports	Provides evidence of project updates & project management	Available on Project File
Project Execution Plan	Provides evidence of project costings & sources of funding	Available on Project File
Payments, grant claims & claim reports	To assess expenditure & claim recoupment	Available on File & Councils Accounts System Centros

Data Availability and Proposed Next Steps

All data appropriate to the current stage of this project is available on file.

Section B - Step 5: Key Evaluation Questions

The following section looks at the key evaluation questions for the **Wexfordia Heritage Park Development Project** based on the findings from the previous sections of this report.

Does the delivery of the project/programme comply with the standards set out in the Public Spending Code? (Appraisal Stage, Implementation Stage and Post-Implementation Stage)

This project is currently under consideration and all project documentation reviewed indicates compliance with the Public Spending Code.

Is the necessary data and information available such that the project/programme can be subjected to a full evaluation at a later date?

All data appropriate to the current stage of the project is available on file.

What improvements are recommended such that future processes and management are enhanced?

There are no recommendations arising from the review of compliance in this case.

Section C: In-Depth Check Summary

The following section presents a summary of the findings of this In-Depth Check on the Wexfordia Heritage Park Development Project.

Summary of In-Depth Check

The Wexfordia Heritage Park Development Project is shown on the 2022 inventory as a capital project that is under consideration. The tourism and environmental design teams for the Vykingar Village development at the INHP have commenced work on a preliminary design and environmental assessments. It is planned to submit a planning application for the project to An Bord Pleanála towards the end of 2023.

The documentation on file for this stage of the project provides satisfactory assurance that there is compliance with the Public Spending Code. Controls upon which reliance can be placed include:

- Funding Application
- Funding Approval & Letter of Offer
- Project Execution Plan
- Tender documents & assessments
- Executive Orders
- Project reviews
- Funding claims & reports
- Payments & receipts on the Council's Accounts System (Centros)

Appendix C2 – Forth Mountain Activity Centre

Quality Assurance – In Depth Check

Section A: Introduction

This introductory section details the headline information on the programme or project in question.

Programme or Project Information			
Name	Forth Mountain Activity Centre		
Detail	Development of an outdoor activity centre at Carrigfoyle, Shelmaliere Commons, Wexford		
Responsible Body	Wexford County Council		
Current Status	Expenditure being considered		
Start Date	2010		
End Date	N/A		
Overall Cost	€7.76M		

Project Description

The project involves:

- (a) The construction of an outdoor activity centre building, adjacent to the disused Carrigfoyle Quarry. The proposed building will include an indoor climbing wall, conference facilities to accommodate specialist camps, toilets, showers, changing facilities, and meeting rooms.
- (b) The construction of a boathouse at Carrigfoyle Lake, with facilities area and a new access road.

It is proposed that Waterford and Wexford Education Training Board (WWETB) will operate the outdoor activity centre located at Carrigfoyle, to provide a range of activities for individuals and groups. The outdoor activity centre will provide a hub for the Forth Mountain Forest Park and will offer a wide range of educational and tourist activities over time including kayaking, canoeing, stand-up paddle boarding, mountain biking, archery, zip lining and specialist camps.

Section B - Step 1: Logic Model Mapping

As part of this In-Depth Check, Internal Audit, Wexford County Council (WCC), have completed a Programme Logic Model (PLM) for the **Forth Mountain Activity Centre Project**. A PLM is a standard evaluation tool and further information on their nature is available in the <u>Public Spending</u> <u>Code</u>.

Objectives	Inputs	Activities	Outputs	Outcomes
 Provide an outdoor activity centre facility to cater for approx. 68,000 visitors per annum The centre building will cater for the needs of the users of the activity centre The boathouse will facilitate outdoor water sports Enhance Wexford's tourism offering 	 Estimated project cost of €7.76M, funded by WCC & WWETB External consultants providing design & construction related consultancy services In-house project management/co- ordination arrangements 	 Business case analysis Preliminary project appraisal & cost estimates Tender requests for consultants & works contractors Part XI pre-planning & planning application process 	 Appointment of consultants & contractors Ground investigations & removal of subsoil Part XI pre-planning & planning applications decided Environmental reports & surveys 	 The provision of an outdoor activity centre building of scale and excellence, alongside a world class trail network The provision of a boathouse to facilitate outdoor water sports on Carrigfoyle Lake

Description of Programme Logic Model

Objectives: The main objective of the project is to develop an outdoor activity centre facility on the site of a disused quarry, at Carrigfoyle, Shelmaliere Commons, Wexford. The purpose of the activity centre will be to provide an outdoor facility, catering for up to 68,000 visitors per annum. The activity centre will provide varying outdoor pursuits such as zip lines, mountain bike trails, walking trails, kayaking on the lake and climbing walls.

The centre building will cater for the needs of users of the outdoor activity centre, by providing changing and shower facilities, an internal Olympic height climbing wall, café/coffee dock, and training rooms.

The provision of a boathouse will facilitate outdoor water sports on Carrigfoyle Lake.

The development of an outdoor activity centre will enhance Wexford's tourism offering.

Inputs: The primary input to the project is the estimated funding of €7.76M provided by WCC and WWETB.

WCC procured consultants to provide design and construction related consultancy services for the various phases of the Forth Mountain Activity Centre Project.

The project will be managed by the Special Projects Section WCC and supervised by the appointed consultants.

Activities: There are a number of activities carried out to date including:

The appointment of a business consultant to prepare a business case analysis report for the Economic Development Section WCC, analysing the proposal put forward by WWETB for an activity park at Forth Mountain.

A preliminary appraisal of the project was carried out by WCC, examining the feasibility of constructing an outdoor activity centre on part of the 26.62 acre site owned by WCC at Carrigfoyle. The appraisal explored the options for the site, quantified costs, specified funding sources, identified risks, and analysed the main options.

Preliminary cost estimates were prepared by consultants for the proposed outdoor activity centre building (\in 7.1M) and proposed boathouse (\in 0.6M).

Tender requests were published by WCC for engineering consultancy services, architectural services, quantity surveying services, environmental assessment services and works contractors.

Part XI pre-planning and planning applications were prepared for the proposed outdoor activity centre building and boathouse.

Outputs: Consultants were appointed to provide engineering consultancy services, quantity surveying services, planning and environmental consultancy services.

Contractors were procured to carry out ground investigation works and for removal of subsoil from the site of the outdoor activity centre.

The Part XI planning application for the proposed outdoor activity centre building was submitted and later withdrawn.

Part XI planning permission was granted for the proposed boathouse. The tender for the works contractor was advertised in April 2023.

Environmental reports and ecological surveys were prepared for the proposed outdoor activity centre.

Outcomes: The envisaged outcome of the project is the provision of an outdoor activity centre building of scale and excellence, alongside a world class trail network.

The provision of a boathouse will facilitate outdoor water sports on Carrigfoyle Lake.

Section B - Step 2: Summary Timeline of Project/Programme

The following section tracks the Forth Mountain Activity Centre Project from inception to conclusion in terms of major project/programme milestones.

Nov 2010	Planning permission was granted for an outdoor activity centre at Carrigfoyle Quarry (LAC0503)	
2016	WWETB proposal for an Outdoor Activity Park at Forth Mountain	
Apr 2017	Business Case Analysis/Outline Business Considerations report for Wexford Outdoor Activity Park, Forth Mountain, prepared for the Economic Development Unit WCC	
Apr 2018	Draft PSC Standard Appraisal Process Report for Carrigfoyle Outdoor Activity Centre	
Dec 2018	Site Investigations Ltd appointed to carry out ground investigation works	
Feb 2019	Sutton Plant Hire appointed to remove subsoil from the site of the proposed carpark and building	
Apr 2019	Site Investigation Report	
Dec 2019	Tender invitations from the Framework for Quantity Surveying Consultancy Services for proposed Outdoor Activity Centre Building	
Jan 2020	Response deadline for submission of tenders for Quantity Surveying Consultancy Services	
Sept 2020	Part XI pre-planning application & assessment for proposed Outdoor Activity Centre Building (PLAC2008)	
Nov 2020	Nolan Construction Consultants appointed to provide quantity surveying services for the proposed Outdoor Activity Centre Building	
Jan 2021	Tender advertised on eTenders and OJEU for Architect Led Design Services for proposed Outdoor Activity Centre Building	
Feb 2021	Response deadline for submission of tenders for Architect Led Design Services for proposed Outdoor Activity Centre Building (There was no appointment from this process)	

Feb 2021	Malone O'Regan Consulting Engineers, appointed to prepare detailed design, tender documents for Carrigfoyle Lake Boathouse
May 2021	Preliminary cost estimates for proposed Outdoor Activity Centre Building
Dec 2021	Part XI pre-planning application & assessment for proposed Boathouse (PLAC2127)
Mar 2022	Part XI planning application for proposed Outdoor Activity Centre Building (LAC2201)
Mar 2022	Submission to An Bord Pleanála (ABP) requesting screening determination (planning ref: LAC2201)
Mar 2022	Preliminary Construction Cost Estimate for proposed Carrigfoyle Lake Boathouse
Apr 2022	ABP request for information (planning ref: LAC2201)
July 2022	Tender documents prepared & issued to 5 firms for environmental assessment services for proposed Outdoor Activity Centre Building, with a response deadline of 1 week
Aug 2022	Roughan & O'Donovan Consulting Engineers, appointed to prepare environmental assessments and reports for proposed Outdoor Activity Centre Building
Aug 2022	Information submitted to ABP as requested (planning ref: LAC2201)
Oct 2022	Withdrawal of Part XI planning application for proposed Outdoor Activity Centre Building (LAC2201)
Nov 2022	Part XI planning application submitted for proposed Carrigfoyle Lake Boathouse (LAC2212)
Jan 2023	Consultants' brief for Design & Construction related consultancy services for proposed Outdoor Activity Centre Building
Feb 2023	Planning permission granted for proposed Carrigfoyle Lake Boathouse (LAC2212)
Apr 2023	Tender advertised on eTenders for works contractors for proposed Carrigfoyle Lake Boathouse

Section B: Evaluation - Step 3: Analysis of Key Documents

The following section reviews the key documentation relating to appraisal, analysis and evaluation for the Forth Mountain Activity Centre Project.

Project/Programme Key Documents		
Title	Details	
LAC0503	Part XI planning permission granted in 2010 for proposed erection of an outdoor activity centre at Carrigfoyle Quarry	
Wexford Outdoor Activity Park Proposal 2016	Business plan analysis prepared by WWETB for the proposed building of an activity park at Carrigfoyle Quarry	
Wexford Outdoor Activity Park Forth Mountain Report	Business Case Analysis/Outline Business Considerations report, prepared for the Economic Development Unit WCC	
Public Spending Code Standard Appraisal Process Report (Draft)	Appraisal report for the Carrigfoyle Outdoor Activity Centre development	
Executive Order No. 932/2018	Accept tender of Site Investigations Ltd for the provision of ground investigation works. The Executive Order was signed on 5 th December 2018.	
Executive Order No. 156/2019	Accept tender of Sutton Plant Hire for the removal of subsoil from the site at Carrigfoyle. The Executive Order was signed on 25 th February 2019.	
Site Investigation Report	Report on ground investigation works at Carrigfoyle Quarry, carried out by Site Investigations Ltd	
PLAC2008 - (Centre Building)	Part XI pre-planning application & assessment for proposed Outdoor Activity Centre Building at Carrigfoyle, Forth Mountain. The planning application was submitted to the Planning Department on 18 th September 2020.	

Executive Order No. 783/2020	Accept tender of Nolan Construction Consultants for the provision of quantity surveying	
	services. The Executive Order was signed on 9 th November 2020.	
	Appointment of Malone O'Regan Consulting Engineers, to prepare the detailed design,	
Executive Order No. 64/2021 – (Boathouse)	tender documents for the Carrigfoyle Lake Boathouse. The Executive Order was signed on	
	5 th February 2021.	
Forth Mountain Centre CE - 18 th May 2021	Preliminary cost estimate for proposed Outdoor Activity Centre Building	
PLAC2127 - (Boathouse)	Part XI pre-planning application & assessment for proposed Boathouse at Carrigfoyle Lake.	
PLACZIZ7 - (Bouthouse)	The application was submitted to the Planning Department on 7 th December 2021.	
	Part XI planning application for proposed Outdoor Activity Centre Building at Carrigfoyle,	
LAC2201 - (Centre Building)	Forth Mountain. The application was submitted to the Planning Department on 9 th March	
	2022.	
ABP-313164-22 - (Centre Building)	Submission to An Bord Pleanála for an EIA Screening Determination on 24 th March 2022	
Preliminary Construction Cost Estimate - (Boathouse)	Preliminary construction cost estimate prepared for the proposed Boathouse	
Tender documents for Environmental	Tender documents for the procurement of a consultant to provide Environmental	
Assessment Services	Assessment Services for the Carrigfoyle Activity Centre Building	
Everything Order No. (00/2022) (Contro	Appointment of Roughan & O'Donovan Consulting Engineers, to provide environmental	
Executive Order No. 696/2022 - (Centre	assessments and reports for the Carrigfoyle Activity Centre Building. The Executive Order	
Building)	was signed on 4 th August 2022.	
EIA Screening Report/August 2022 - (Centre	EIA Screening Report prepared by Roughan & O'Donovan Consulting Engineers for the	
Building)	proposed Outdoor Activity Centre Building	
Appropriate Assessment Screening	Appropriate Assessment Screening Report prepared by Roughan & O'Donovan Consulting	
Report/September 2022 - (Centre Building)	Engineers, for the proposed Outdoor Activity Centre Building	

LAC2201 – Withdrawal of Part 8 Proposal -	Email dated 25 th October 2022 withdrawing Part XI planning application for proposed		
(Centre Building)	Outdoor Activity Centre Building		
Appropriate Assessment – Stage 1 Screening	Appropriate Assessment – Stage 1 Screening Report prepared by Malone O'Regan		
Report/October 2022 – (Boathouse)	Consulting Engineers, for the proposed Boathouse and facilities area at Carrigfoyle Lake		
Ecological Impact Assessment/October 2022 – (Boathouse)	Ecological Impact Assessment prepared by Malone O'Regan Consulting Engineers, for the proposed Boathouse and facilities area at Carrigfoyle Lake		
LAC2212 - (Boathouse)	Part XI planning application for proposed construction of a boathouse and facilities area including new access road at Carrigfoyle. The application was submitted to the Planning Department on 9 th November 2022.		
Consultants' brief for Design & Construction related consultancy services – (Centre Building)	Briefing document prepared for tender for Design & Construction related consultancy services for proposed Outdoor Activity Centre Building		
Works Contractors Tender – (Boathouse)	Tender for works contractors for boathouse published on eTenders on 20 th April 2023.		

Key Document 1: LAC0503

Part XI planning permission was granted to WCC on 8th November 2010, for the proposed erection of an outdoor activity centre consisting of reception building, storage compound, boathouse, 2 no. climbing towers with twin zip wires running between towers, aerial trekking course and installation of a new septic tank with evapotranspiration (willow) treatment system and associated site works at Carrigfoyle Quarry, Shelmaliere Commons, Co. Wexford.

Key Document 2: Wexford Outdoor Activity Park Proposal 2016

Business plan prepared by WWETB analysing a proposal for WCC and WWETB to build an activity park situated at Carrigfoyle Quarry at the top of Forth Mountain. The plan includes market analysis, marketing/sales strategy, research and development, staffing and operations and financial projections.

Key Document 3: Wexford Outdoor Activity Park Forth Mountain Report

The Economic Development Unit WCC engaged Ennis & Co. Business Consultants, to analyse the business case/proposal advanced by WWETB, for the proposed establishment of the Wexford Outdoor Activity Park at Forth Mountain, Co. Wexford.

Key Document 4: Public Spending Code Standard Appraisal Process Report (Draft)

In April 2018, WCC carried out an appraisal of the Carrigfoyle Outdoor Activity Centre development. The report outlined the main objective of WCC i.e., facilitate the development of an outdoor activity centre. The appraisal also explored the options for the site, quantified costs, specified funding sources, identified risks, and analysed the main options.

Key Document 5: Executive Order No. 932/2018

Executive Order approval accepting the tender of Site Investigations Ltd for ground investigation works for the Carrigfoyle Outdoor Activity Centre. The Executive Order was signed on 5th December 2018.

Key Document 6: Executive Order No. 156/2019

Executive Order approval accepting the tender of Sutton Plant Hire for the removal of subsoil from the location of the carpark and building for the Carrigfoyle Outdoor Activity Centre. The Executive Order was signed on 25th February 2019.

Key Document 7: Site Investigation Report

In April 2019, Site Investigations Ltd issued a report on the ground investigation works at Carrigfoyle Quarry.

Key Document 8: PLAC2008

The Special Projects Section WCC submitted a Part XI pre-planning application to the Planning Department WCC on 18th September 2020, for the proposed Outdoor Activity Centre Building at Carrigfoyle, Forth Mountain, comprising changing rooms, meeting rooms, café, climbing wall, a roof terrace and reception area including provision of a foul water pumping station.

Key Document 9: Executive Order No. 783/2020

In December 2019, WCC invited 3 tenders from the Framework for Quantity Surveying Consultancy Services to provide quantity surveying services on the Carrigfoyle Outdoor Activity Centre Building Project. The tender of Nolan Construction Consultants was successful. The Executive Order approval accepting their tender was signed on 9th November 2020.

Key Document 10: Executive Order No. 64/2021

Executive Order appointing Malone O'Regan Consulting Engineers, to prepare the detailed design, tender documents for Carrigfoyle Lake Boathouse. The Executive Order was signed on 5th February 2021.

Key Document 11: Forth Mountain Centre CE - 18th May 2021

2021 preliminary cost estimate for the proposed Outdoor Activity Centre Building at Carrigfoyle.

Key Document 12: PLAC2127

The Special Projects Section WCC submitted a Part XI pre-planning application to the Planning Department WCC on 7th December 2021, for the proposed Boathouse at Carrigfoyle Lake, including a new access road and outdoor toilet block next to existing car park.

Key Document 13: LAC2201

The Housing Section WCC submitted a Part XI planning application to the Planning Department WCC on 9th March 2022, for the proposed erection of an Outdoor Activity Centre Building at Carrigfoyle, Forth Mountain, comprising changing rooms, meeting rooms, cafe, climbing wall, a roof terrace and reception area.

Key Document 14: ABP-313164-22

A submission was made to An Bord Pleanála (ABP) on 24th March 2022, requesting a screening determination as to whether the proposed development (Outdoor Activity Centre Building) would be likely to have significant effects on the environment. On 4th April 2022, ABP requested WCC to submit information specified in Schedule 7A of the Planning & Development Regulations 2001, as amended.

Key Document 15: Preliminary Construction Cost Estimate

In March 2022, Malone O'Regan Consulting Engineers, prepared a preliminary construction cost estimate for the construction of the proposed boathouse, public toilets, and bike park at the Carrigfoyle Activity Centre, Barntown, Co. Wexford.

Key Document 16: Tender Documents for Environmental Assessment Services

Tender documents for the procurement of a consultant to provide Environmental Assessment Services for the Carrigfoyle Activity Centre Building.

Key Document 17: Executive Order No. 696/2022

Executive Order appointing Roughan & O'Donovan Consulting Engineers, to provide environmental assessments and reports for the Carrigfoyle Activity Centre Building, and provide the information requested by ABP on 4th April 2022. The Executive Order was signed on 4th August 2022.

Key Document 18: EIA Screening Report/August 2022

EIA Screening Report prepared by Roughan & O'Donovan Consulting Engineers, for the proposed Outdoor Activity Centre Building at Carrigfoyle, Forth Mountain. The purpose of the EIA Screening Report is to provide the information requested by ABP, set out in Schedule 7A of the Planning & Development Regulations 2001, as amended, and to inform WCC whether an Environmental Impact Assessment Report (EIAR) is required.

Key Document 19: Appropriate Assessment Screening Report/September 2022

Appropriate Assessment Screening Report prepared by Roughan & O'Donovan Consulting Engineers, for the proposed Outdoor Activity Centre Building at Carrigfoyle, Forth Mountain. The purpose of the Appropriate Assessment Screening Report is to inform WCC whether the proposed development is likely to have a significant effect on any European Site in view of their Conservation objectives.

Key Document 20: LAC2201 – Withdrawal of Part 8 Proposal

Email dated 25th October 2022 from Acting DOS Capital Development to Planning Department WCC, withdrawing Part XI planning application for proposed Outdoor Activity Centre Building at Carrigfoyle, Forth Mountain. The Planning Department WCC subsequently notified ABP on 27th October 2022, that LAC2201 is no longer under consideration by the Planning Authority.

Key Document 21: Appropriate Assessment – Stage 1 Screening Report/October 2022

Appropriate Assessment – Stage 1 Screening Report prepared by Malone O'Regan Consulting Engineers, for the proposed boathouse and facilities area at Carrigfoyle Lake. The purpose of the Appropriate Assessment- Stage 1 Screening Report is to inform WCC whether the proposed development is likely to have a significant effect on the Conservation objectives of any Natura 2000 European Designated Sites.

Key Document 22: Ecological Impact Assessment/October 2022

Ecological Impact Assessment prepared by Malone O'Regan Consulting Engineers, for the proposed boathouse and facilities area at Carrigfoyle Lake. The purpose of the Ecological Impact Assessment is to survey and assess the land within and adjacent to the site for the presence of any habitats or species that could present a constraint on or an opportunity for enhancement due to the proposed development.

Key Document 23: LAC2212

The Special Projects Section WCC submitted a Part XI planning application to the Planning Department WCC on 9th November 2022, for the proposed construction of a boathouse and facilities area including new access road at Carrigfoyle. Planning permission was approved by members on 13th February 2023.

Key Document 24: Consultants' brief for Design & Construction related consultancy services

Consultants' brief for Design & Construction related consultancy services (January 2023) prepared as part of the tendering process for the proposed Outdoor Activity Centre Building.

Key Document 25: Works Contractors Tender

Tender documents for works contractors for boathouse, jetty, access, and ancillary works at Carrigfoyle Quarry, Co. Wexford. The request for tenders was published on eTenders on 20th April 2023.

Section B - Step 4: Data Audit

The following section details the data audit that was carried out for the **Forth Mountain Activity Centre Project**. It evaluates whether appropriate data is available for the future evaluation of the project/programme.

Data Required	Use	Availability
Business plan analysis & appraisal of project	Outline objectives, explore options, quantify costs, specify sources of funding, identify risks and recommendation on preferred options	Available on Project File
Tender reports & Executive Orders appointing consultants and contractors	Provides evidence of procurement for services & approval for appointments	Available on Project File
Cost estimate reports	Provides evidence of project costings	Available on Project File
Pre-Planning & Planning Applications for Part XI Proposals	Provides evidence of the required planning approvals	Available on Project File
Environmental Reports	Provides evidence of environmental obligations	Available on Project File
Progress Meeting Minutes	Provide evidence of project management	Available on Project File

Data Availability and Proposed Next Steps

All data appropriate to the current stage of this project is available on file.

Section B - Step 5: Key Evaluation Questions

The following section looks at the key evaluation questions for the **Forth Mountain Activity Centre Project** based on the findings from the previous sections of this report.

Does the delivery of the project/programme comply with the standards set out in the Public Spending Code? (Appraisal Stage, Implementation Stage and Post-Implementation Stage)

This project is currently under consideration and all project documentation reviewed indicates compliance with the Public Spending Code.

Is the necessary data and information available such that the project/programme can be subjected to a full evaluation at a later date?

All data appropriate to the current stage of the project is available on file.

What improvements are recommended such that future processes and management are enhanced?

There are no recommendations arising from the review of compliance in this case.

The following section presents a summary of the findings of this In-Depth Check on the Forth Mountain Activity Centre Project.

Summary of In-Depth Check

The Forth Mountain Activity Centre Project is shown on the 2022 inventory as a capital project that is under consideration. This proposed development is in addition to the development of a series of walking trails around the site, a new access road, car park and utility services including water, wastewater and power. These works are now substantially complete and open to the public. A process to procure a consulting team to prepare an EIAR and prepare a planning submission to ABP for the Outdoor Activity Centre Building is now required. The tender for works for the Boathouse was advertised in April 2023 and it is expected that a contract award will be made by August 2023 with commencement on site by September 2023.

The documentation on file for this stage of the project provides satisfactory assurance that there is compliance with the Public Spending Code. Controls upon which reliance can be placed include:

- Business Plan Analysis & Project Appraisal
- Cost estimates
- Tender Reports
- Executive Orders
- Part XI planning applications & assessments
- Environmental Reports
- Minutes of progress meetings

APPENDIX C3 – 13 NO. TURNKEY PROPERTIES AT ROXSBOROUGH MANOR. MULGANNON, WEXFORD

Quality Assurance – In Depth Check

Section A: Introduction

This introductory section details the headline information on the programme or project in question.

Programme or Project Information		
Name	13 no. Turnkey properties at Roxborough Manor, Mulgannon, Wexford, Co. Wexford	
Detail	The acquisition on a turnkey basis of 13 no. properties at Roxborough Manor, Mulgannon, Wexford to help satisfy housing demand in the urban area of Wexford.	
Responsible Body	Wexford County Council	
Current Status	Expenditure being incurred	
Start Date	23 July 2020	
End Date	25 April 2023	
Overall Cost	€2.96M	

Project Description

The project involved the acquisition of 13 no. Turnkey properties at Roxborough Manor, Mulgannon, Wexford, Co. Wexford, following a public advertisement calling for expressions of interest for the supply of social housing, particularly within the urban areas of Wexford and Gorey where current housing demand is prioritised. The acquisition comprised 2 no. 2-bed terraced houses, 7 no. 3-bed houses, 2 no. 4-bed houses, and 2 no. 4-bed adaptable houses, at a total cost of €2,908,000.

Section B: Evaluation - Step 1: Logic Model Mapping

As part of this In-Depth Check, Internal Audit, Wexford County Council has completed a Programme Logic Model (PLM) for the acquisition of 13 no. Turnkey properties at Roxborough Manor, Mulgannon, Wexford. A PLM is a standard evaluation tool and further information on their nature is available in the <u>Public Spending Code</u>.

Objectives	Inputs	Activities	Outputs	Outcomes
The provision of a supply of social housing in the Wexford urban area where addressing current housing demand is prioritised	The primary input to the project is the funding of €2.96M from the DHLGH	 Public advertisement in local newspapers calling for Expressions of Interest for the Supply of Social Housing Receipt and Evaluation of Proposal Valuation Report Application for funding, including Sustainable Community Proofing, to the DHLGH Approval of DHLGH and Chief Executive to proceed with the acquisition of 13 no. Turnkey Properties 	The delivery of the agreed 13 no. Turnkey units, on a phased basis, as construction was completed	The availability of a supply of 2, 3 and 4 bed social housing units to meet demand in an area where a need was identified

Description of Programme Logic Model

- *Objectives:* The objective was to provide a supply of social housing in the Wexford urban area where current housing demand is prioritised.
- *Inputs:* The primary project input is capital funding of €2.96M from the Department of Housing, Local Government & Heritage (DHLGH).
- Activities: Wexford County Council placed an advert in local newspapers in December 2020 calling for expressions of interest for the supply of social housing via turnkey developments and mixed development schemes.

A developer responded with a proposal to deliver 13 turnkey units at Roxborough Manor, Mulgannon.

Wexford County Council's Internal Housing Committee met on 10 March 2021, considered the proposal, and agreed to support the acquisition of 13 turnkey units having assessed it under the following headings:

- Demand for Social Housing
- Sustainability/Saturation
- Design (Suitability for Social Housing)
- Cost/Value for Money
- Probability of Failure to Deliver
- Ability to Deliver

The Evaluation document recorded a pass on all three of the following headings:

- 1. Location & Suitability of the Site for Social housing
- 2. Land Zoning Status compatible with residential development
- 3. All necessary Utilities available

Sufficient marks were allocated under all three of the following headings:

- 1. Response to briefing doc: 40 (out of 40), (min pass mark 30)
- 2. Value for Money: 30 (out of 35), (min pass mark 25)
- 3. Timescale for Delivery 25 (out of 25), (min pass mark 15)

An Independent Market Valuation was conducted on behalf of Wexford County Council valuing the house types as follows:

- 2 bed terraced, type L, 905 sq. ft., €190,000
- 3 bed, type F, 1171 sq. ft, €230,000
- 3 bed, type G, 1091 sq. ft, €215,000
- 4 bed, type E, 1295 sq. ft, €245,000

An application for funding including Sustainable Community Proofing was submitted to the Department of Housing, Local Government and Heritage (DHLGH).

The DHLGH approved an overall budget of €2,992,160 for the project, including €2,908,000 for the acquisition of 13 no. Housing Units, €58,160 for Legal & Professional Fees and €26,000 for LA Project Management Fee.

The Chief Executive approved the acquisition of 13 no. Turnkey properties at Roxborough Manor, Mulgannon, Wexford, Co. Wexford

- *Outputs:* The outputs of the project are the delivery of the agreed 13 no. Turnkey units, on a phased basis, as construction was completed.
- *Outcomes:* The outcome of the project is the availability of a supply of 2, 3 and 4-bed social housing units to meet the demand in an area where a need has been identified.

Section B: Evaluation - Step 2: Summary Timeline of Project / Programme Life Cycle

The following section tracks the acquisition of 13 no. Turnkey properties at Roxborough Manor, Mulgannon, Wexford from inception to conclusion

July 2020	Independent Valuation Report (This valuation was submitted with a previously approved, but withdrawn Turnkey proposal)
December 2020	Public Advertisement calling for Expressions of Interest for the Supply of Social Housing
December 2020	Proposal received from Colm Neville Construction proposing the delivery of houses at Roxborough Manor, Mulgannon, Wexford, Co. Wexford.
March 2021	Evaluation of Proposal to acquire 13 units at Roxborough Manor as a Turnkey acquisition by Internal Housing Committee. Internal Housing Committee agreed to accept proposal.
May 2021	Application for funding including Sustainable Community Proofing submitted to the DHLGH
May 2021	Approval received from the DHLGH for the acquisition of 13 no. Turnkey properties at Roxborough Manor, Mulgannon, Wexford, Co. Wexford. Approved budget of €2,992,160 for the project, including €2,908,000 for the acquisition of 13 no. Housing Units, €58,160 for Legal & Professional Fees and €26,000 for LA Project Management Fee.
June 2021	Approval by Chief Executive for the acquisition of 13 no. units at Roxborough Manor, Mulgannon, Wexford, Co. Wexford via Turnkey acquisition
August 2021 – November 2022	Contracts exchanged and signed between Colm Neville Construction and Wexford County Council for individual houses as they are delivered
June – November 2022	Delivery of housing units on a phased basis as construction is completed

Section B: Evaluation - Step 3: Analysis of Key Documents

The following section reviews the key documentation relating to appraisal, analysis, and evaluation for the acquisition of 13 no. Turnkey properties at Roxborough Manor, Mulgannon, Wexford.

Project/Programme Key Documents			
Title	Details		
Advertisement calling for Expressions of Interest	Public Advertisement calling for Expressions of Interest for the Supply of Social Housing in areas where current housing demand is prioritised		
Proposal from Colm Neville Construction	Proposal from Colm Neville Construction offering houses at Roxborough Manor, Mulgannon, Wexford, Co. Wexford		
Evaluation of Proposal	Evaluation of Proposal to acquire 13 units at Roxborough Manor as a Turnkey acquisition by Internal Housing Committee. Internal Housing Committee agreed to accept proposal.		
Valuation Report	Independent Market Valuation conducted on behalf of Wexford County Council valuing the various house types.		
Funding Application to the DHLGH	Application for funding including Sustainable Community Proofing submitted to the DHLGH		
Funding Approval from the DHLGH	Approval Notification dated 24 May 2021		
Project Execution Plan	Project Execution Plan approved 28 June 2021		
Executive Order 468/2021	Approval to pay €2,908,000 to Colm Neville Construction for the acquisition of 13 no. Turnkey properties at Manor Crescent, Roxborough Manor.		
Contracts for Sale / Building Agreements	Individual Contracts for Sale / Building Agreements between Colm Neville Construction and Wexford County Council for acquisition of each of the 13 no. houses.		

HCA4 Capital Grant Claim Forms	DHLGH HCA4 Capital Grant Claim Forms and HCA3 Acquisition of Private Dwellings Forms
&	submitted 6 December 2021 (10% deposit on turnkey scheme), 28 June 2022 (10 units), 6
HCA3 Acquisition of Private Dwellings Forms	December 2022 (3 units & legal fees for 3 units) & 17 April 2023 (legal fees for 10 units).
Turnkey Admin Claim Form	DHLGH Turnkey Admin Claim Form submitted 29 June 2022 (for 10 units) & 19 December 2022 (for 3 units)

Key Document 1: Advertisement calling for Expressions of Interest

A public advertisement in local newspapers on 21 December 2020 calling for expressions of interest for the supply of social housing via turnkey developments and mixed development schemes.

Key Document 2: Proposal from Colm Neville Construction

Proposal received from Colm Neville Construction proposing the delivery of houses at Roxborough Manor, Mulgannon, Wexford, Co. Wexford.

Key Document 3: Evaluation of Proposal

Wexford County Council's Internal Housing Committee met on 10 March 2021, considered the proposal, and agreed to support the acquisition of 13 turnkey units having assessed it under the following headings:

- Demand for Social Housing
- Sustainability/Saturation
- Design (Suitability for Social Housing)
- Cost/Value for Money
- Probability of Failure to Deliver
- Ability to Deliver

The Evaluation document recorded a pass on all three of the following headings:

- 1. Location & Suitability of the Site for Social housing
- 2. Land Zoning Status compatible with residential development
- 3. All necessary Utilities available

Sufficient marks were allocated under all three of the following headings:

- 1. Response to briefing doc: 40 (out of 40), (min pass mark 30)
- 2. Value for Money: 30 (out of 35), (min pass mark 25)
- 3. Timescale for Delivery 25 (out of 25), (min pass mark 15)

Key Document 4: Valuation Report

An Independent Market Valuation was conducted on behalf of Wexford County Council valuing the house types as follows:

- 2 bed terraced, type L, 905 sq. ft., €190,000
- 3 bed, type F, 1171 sq. ft, €230,000
- 3 bed, type G, 1091 sq. ft, €215,000
- 4 bed, type E, 1295 sq. ft, €245,000

Key Document 5: Funding Application to the DHLGH

An application for funding including Sustainable Community Proofing was submitted to the Department of Housing, Local Government and Heritage (DHLGH) for approval.

Key Document 6: Funding Approval from the DHLGH

The Approval Notification from the DHLGH, for the acquisition of 13 no. turnkey units is dated 24 May 2021. The DHLGH approved an overall budget of €2,992,160 for the project, including €2,908,000 for the acquisition of 13 no. Housing Units, €58,160 for Legal & Professional Fees and €26,000 for LA Project Management Fee.

Key Document 7: Project Execution Plan

The Project Execution Plan, approved on 28 June 2021 details the Project Brief, Project Phase, Project Development and Implementation Approach, Programme Milestones, Project Cost and Funding Certification.

Key Document 8: Executive Order 468/2021

The Chief Executive approved the payment of €2,908,000 to Colm Neville Construction for the acquisition of 13 no. Turnkey properties at Roxborough Manor with Executive Order 468/2021 signed on 28 June 2021.

Key Documents 9: Contracts for Sale / Building Agreements

Individual Contracts for Sale / Building Agreements were signed between Colm Neville Construction and Wexford County Council for acquisition of each of the 13 no. houses as they were delivered.

Key Documents 10: DHLGH HCA4 Capital Grant Claim Forms, HCA3 Acquisition of Private Dwellings Forms & Turnkey Admin Claim Forms

DHLGH HCA4 Capital Grant Claim Forms and HCA3 Acquisition of Private Dwellings Forms submitted on 6 December 2021 (10% deposit on turnkey scheme), 28 June 2022 (10 units), 6 December 2022 (3 units & legal fees for 3 units) & 17 April 2023 (legal fees for 10 units). DHLGH Turnkey Admin Claim Form submitted 29 June 2022 (for 10 units) & 19 December 2022 (for 3 units). All claims being the full budget approval for acquisition of 13 no. units at Roxborough Manor, vouched legal fees, and LA admin / project management fees.

Section B: Evaluation - Step 4: Data Audit

The following section details the data audit that was carried out for the acquisition of 13 no. Turnkey properties at Roxborough Manor, Mulgannon, Wexford. It evaluates whether appropriate data is available for the future evaluation of the project/programme.

Data Required	Use	Availability
Evaluation & Agreement of Proposal	To evaluate need, sustainability, suitability, cost, and compliance with public procurement procedures	Available on Project File
Application for funding to the DHLGH	Appraisal of proposed acquisition including independent valuation report and as per requirement for transparency, an explanation of how proposal was selected	Available on Project File
Approval of the DHLGH	To confirm DHLGH formal approval for the acquisition of 13 no. Turnkey properties at Roxborough Manor, Mulgannon, Wexford	Available on Project File
Contracts for Sale/Building Agreements	To assess the nature of the contract and agreement	Available on Project File
Executive Order 468/2021	To confirm Wexford County Council's formal approval for the acquisition of 13 no. Turnkey properties at Roxborough Manor, Mulgannon, Wexford	Available on Project File
Payments & grant draw-down	To assess expenditure and claim recoupment	Available on Project File & Accounts System

Data Availability and Proposed Next Steps

All data appropriate to all stages of this project are available on file.

Section B: Evaluation - Step 5: Key Evaluation Questions

The following section looks at the key evaluation questions for the acquisition of 13 no. Turnkey properties at Roxborough Manor, Mulgannon, Wexford, based on the findings from the previous sections of this report.

Does the delivery of the project/programme comply with the standards set out in the Public Spending Code? (Appraisal Stage, Implementation Stage and Post-Implementation Stage)

The delivery of the project complies with the standards set out in the Public Spending Code.

Is the necessary data and information available such that the project/programme can be subjected to a full evaluation at a later date?

There is sufficient data and information available to ensure that the project can be subjected to a full evaluation at a later date.

What improvements are recommended such that future processes and management are enhanced?

There are no recommendations arising from the review of compliance in this case

Section C: Summary and Conclusions

The following section presents a summary of the findings of this In-Depth Check on the acquisition of 13 no. Turnkey properties at Roxborough Manor, Mulgannon, Wexford.

Summary of In-Depth Check

The project documentation for all stages of this project provides satisfactory assurance that there is compliance with the Public Spending Code. Controls upon which reliance can be placed are included in the following documentation:

- Advertisement calling for Expressions of Interest
- Proposal from Colm Neville Construction
- Evaluation and Agreement of Proposal
- Independent Valuation Report
- Application to the DHLGH for funding
- Approval from the DHLGH for funding
- Project Execution Plan
- Contracts for Sale/Building Agreements
- Executive Order 468/2021
- HCA 4 Capital Grant Claim Forms
- HCA3 Acquisition of Private Dwellings Forms
- Turnkey Admin Claim Form
- Payments & grant draw-down

Appendix C4 – 20 No. TURNKEY PROPERTIES AT CLUAIN BEAG, CLONARD, WEXFORD

Quality Assurance – In Depth Check

Section A: Introduction

This introductory section details the headline information on the programme or project in question.

Programme or Project Information		
Name	20 no. Turnkey properties at Cluain Beag, Clonard, Wexford, Co. Wexford	
Detail	The acquisition on a turnkey basis of 20 no. properties at Cluain Beag, Clonard, Wexford to help satisfy housing demand in the urban area of Wexford.	
Responsible Body	Wexford County Council	
Current Status	Expenditure Completed	
Start Date	12 February 2019	
End Date	7 October 2022	
Overall Cost	€4.34M	

Project Description

The project involved the acquisition of 20 no. Turnkey properties at Cluain Beag, Clonard, Wexford, Co. Wexford, following a public advertisement calling for expressions of interest for the supply of social housing, particularly within the urban areas of Wexford, Gorey, Enniscorthy and New Ross, where current housing demand is prioritised. The acquisition comprised 15 no. 3-bed semi-detached houses, 1 no. 3-bed detached house, and 4 no. 2-bed terraced houses, at a total cost of €4,260,000.

Section B: Evaluation - Step 1: Logic Model Mapping

As part of this In-Depth Check, Internal Audit, Wexford County Council has completed a Programme Logic Model (PLM) for the acquisition of 20 no. Turnkey properties at Cluain Beag, Clonard, Wexford. A PLM is a standard evaluation tool and further information on their nature is available in the <u>Public Spending Code</u>.

Objectives	Inputs	Activities	Outputs	Outcomes
The provision of a supply of social housing in the Wexford urban area where addressing current housing demand is prioritised	The primary input to the project is the funding of €4.34M from the DHLGH	 Public advertisement in local newspapers calling for Expressions of Interest for the Supply of Social Housing Receipt and Evaluation of Proposal Valuation Report Application for funding, including Sustainable Community Proofing, to the DHLGH Approval of DHLGH and Chief Executive to proceed with the acquisition of 20 no. Turnkey Properties 	The delivery of the agreed 20 no. Turnkey units, on a phased basis, as construction was completed	The availability of a supply of 2 and 3 bed social housing units to meet demand in an area where a need was identified

Description of Programme Logic Model

- *Objectives:* The objective was to provide a supply of social housing in the Wexford urban area where current housing demand is prioritised.
- *Inputs:* The primary project input is capital funding of €4.34M from the Department of Housing, Local Government & Heritage (DHLGH).
- Activities: Wexford County Council placed an advert in local newspapers in February 2019 calling for expressions of interest for the supply of social housing via turnkey developments, serviced land zoned for residential development and mixed development schemes.

A developer responded with a proposal to deliver turnkey units at Cluain Beag, Clonard. Wexford County Council's Internal Housing Committee met on 28 February 2019, considered the proposal, and agreed to support the acquisition of 20 turnkey units having assessed it under the following headings:

- Demand for Social Housing
- Sustainability/Saturation
- Design (Suitability for Social Housing)
- Cost/Value for Money
- Probability of Failure to Deliver

An Independent Market Valuation was conducted on behalf of Wexford County Council valuing the house types as follows:

- 3-bed semi-detached, Type A, 97 sqm, €215K-220K
- 3-bed detached, Type A1, 99 sqm, €220K-225K
- 2-bed terraced, Type B, 76 sqm, €180K-185K

An application for funding including Sustainable Community Proofing was submitted to the Department of Housing, Local Government and Heritage (DHLGH).

The DHLGH approved an overall budget of €4,385,200 for the project, including €4,260,000 for the acquisition of 20 no. Housing Units, €85,200 for Legal & Professional Fees and €40,000 for LA Project Management Fee.

The Chief Executive approved the acquisition of 20 no. Turnkey properties at Cluain Beag, Clonard, Wexford, Co. Wexford.

- *Outputs:* The outputs of the project are the delivery of the agreed 20 no. Turnkey units, on a phased basis, as construction was completed.
- *Outcomes:* The outcome of the project is the availability of a supply of 2 and 3-bed social housing units to meet the demand in an area where a need has been identified.

Section B: Evaluation - Step 2: Summary Timeline of Project / Programme Life Cycle

The following section tracks the acquisition of 20 no. Turnkey Properties at Cluain Beag, Clonard, Wexford from inception to conclusion in terms of major project/programme milestones

February 2019	Public Advertisement calling for Expressions of Interest for the Supply of Social Housing
February 2019	Proposal received from William Neville & Sons Construction proposing the delivery of houses at Cluain Beag, Clonard, Wexford, Co. Wexford.
February 2019	Evaluation of Proposal to acquire 20 units at Cluain Beag as a Turnkey acquisition by Internal Housing Committee. Internal Housing Committee agreed to accept proposal. As there is a Part V liability, 6 units were delivered under Part V and 20 via Turnkey acquisition.
June 2020	Independent Valuation Report
July 2020	Application for funding including Sustainable Community Proofing submitted to the DHLGH
September 2020	Approval received from the DHLGH for the acquisition of 20 no. Turnkey Properties at Cluain Beag, Clonard, Wexford, Co. Wexford. Approved budget €4,385,200 for 20 No. Turnkeys €4,260,000, Legal & Professional Fees: €85,200, Project Management Fees: €40,000
November 2020	Approval by Chief Executive for the acquisition of 20 no. units at Cluain Beag, Clonard, Wexford, Co. Wexford via Turnkey acquisition
October 2020 – June 2022	Contracts exchanged and signed between William Neville & Sons Construction and Wexford County Council for individual houses as they are delivered
September 2021 – June 2022	Delivery of housing units on a phased basis as construction is completed

Section B: Evaluation - Step 3: Analysis of Key Documents

The following section reviews the key documentation relating to appraisal, analysis, and evaluation for the acquisition of 20 no. Turnkey Properties at Cluain Beag, Clonard, Wexford.

Project/Programme Key Documents	
Title	Details
Advertisement calling for Expressions of Interest	Public Advertisement calling for Expressions of Interest for the Supply of Social Housing in areas where current housing demand is prioritised
Proposal from William Neville & Sons Construction	Proposal from William Neville & Sons Construction offering houses at Cluain Beag, Clonard, Wexford, Co. Wexford.
Evaluation of Proposal	Evaluation of Proposal to acquire 20 units at Cluain Beag as a Turnkey acquisition by Internal Housing Committee. Internal Housing Committee agreed to accept proposal. As there is a Part V liability, 6 units were delivered under Part V and 20 via Turnkey acquisition.
Valuation Report	Independent Market Valuation conducted on behalf of Wexford County Council valuing the various house types.
Funding Application to the DHLGH	Application for funding including Sustainable Community Proofing submitted to the DHLGH
Funding Approval from the DHLGH	Approval Notification dated 25 September 2020
Project Execution Plan	Project Execution Plan approved 11 November 2020
Executive Order 827/2020	Approval to pay €4,260,000 to William Neville & Sons Construction for the acquisition of 20 no. Turnkey properties at Cluain Beag,

HCA3 Acquisition of Private Dwellings Forms Turnkey Admin Claim Form	July 2022 (2 units), 20 September 2022 (legal fees for 20 units). DHLGH Turnkey Admin Claim Form submitted 7 February 2022 (for 11 units) and 26 July 2022 (for 9 units).
HCA4 Capital Grant Claim Forms &	DHLGH HCA4 Capital Grant Claim Forms and HCA3 Acquisition of Private Dwellings Forms submitted 15 December 2021 (5 units), 24 January 2022 (6 units), 5 April 2022 (7 units), 26
Contracts for Sale / Building Agreements	Individual Contracts for Sale / Building Agreements between William Neville & Sons Construction and Wexford County Council for acquisition of each of the 20 no. houses.

Key Document 1: Advertisement calling for Expressions of Interest

A public advertisement in local newspapers on 12 February 2019 calling for expressions of interest for the supply of social housing via turnkey developments, serviced land zoned for residential development and mixed development schemes.

Key Document 2: Proposal from William Neville & Sons Construction

Proposal received from William Neville & Sons Construction proposing the delivery of houses at Cluain Beag, Clonard, Wexford, Co. Wexford.

Key Document 3: Evaluation of Proposal

Wexford County Council's Internal Housing Committee met on 28 February 2019, considered the proposal, and agreed to support the acquisition of 20 turnkey units having assessed it under the following headings:

- Demand for Social Housing
- Sustainability/Saturation
- Design (Suitability for Social Housing)
- Cost/Value for Money
- Probability of Failure to Deliver

Key Document 4: Valuation Report

An Independent Market Valuation was conducted on behalf of Wexford County Council valuing the house types as follows: 3-bed semi-detached, Type A, 97 sqm, €215K-220K, 3-bed detached, Type A1, 99 sqm, €220K-225K, 2-bed terraced, Type B, 76 sqm, €180K-185K

Key Document 5: Funding Application to the DHLGH

An application for funding including Sustainable Community Proofing was submitted to the Department of Housing, Local Government and Heritage (DHLGH) for approval.

Key Document 6: Funding Approval from the DHLGH

The Approval Notification from the DHLGH, for the acquisition of 20 no. turnkey units is dated 25 September 2020. The DHLGH approved an overall budget of €4,385,200 for the project, including €4,260,000 for the acquisition of 20 no. Housing Units, €85,200 for Legal & Professional Fees and €40,000 for LA Project Management Fee.

Key Document 7: Project Execution Plan

The Project Execution Plan, approved on 11 November 2020, details the Project Brief, Project Phase, Project Development and Implementation Approach, Programme Milestones, Project Cost and Funding Certification.

Key Document 8: Executive Order 827/2020

The Chief Executive approved the payment of €4,260,000 to William Neville & Sons Construction for the acquisition of 20 no. Turnkey properties at Cluain Beag with Executive Order 827/2020 signed on 16 November 2020.

Key Documents 9: Contracts for Sale / Building Agreements

Individual Contracts for Sale / Building Agreements were signed between William Neville & Sons Construction and Wexford County Council for acquisition of each of the 20 no. houses as they were delivered.

Key Documents 10: HCA4 Capital Grant Claim Forms, HCA3 Acquisition of Private Dwellings Forms & Turnkey Admin Claim Form

DHLGH HCA4 Capital Grant Claim Forms and HCA3 Acquisition of Private Dwellings Forms submitted on 15 December 2021 (5 units), 24 January 2022 (6 units), 5 April 2022 (7 units), 26 July 2022 (2 units), 20 September 2022 (legal fees for 20 units). DHLGH Turnkey Admin Claim Form submitted 7 February 2022 (11 units) and 26 July 2022 (9 units). All claim forms completed to draw down €4,345,939.15 from the DHLGH, in line with budget approval for acquisition of 20 no. units at Cluain Beag, vouched legal fees, and LA admin / project management fees.

Section B: Evaluation - Step 4: Data Audit

The following section details the data audit that was carried out for the acquisition of 20 no. Turnkey properties at Cluain Beag, Clonard, Wexford. It evaluates whether appropriate data is available for the future evaluation of the project/programme.

Data Required	Use	Availability
Evaluation & Agreement of Proposal	To evaluate need, sustainability, suitability, cost, and compliance with public procurement procedures	Available on Project File
Application for funding to the DHLGH	Appraisal of proposed acquisition including independent valuation report and as per requirement for transparency, an explanation of how proposal was selected	Available on Project File
Approval of the DHLGH	To confirm DHLGH formal approval for the acquisition of 20 no. Turnkey properties at Cluain Beag, Clonard, Wexford	Available on Project File
Contracts for Sale/Building Agreements	To assess the nature of the contract and agreement	Available on Project File
Executive Order 827/2020	To confirm Wexford County Council's formal approval for the acquisition of 20 no. Turnkey properties at Cluain Beag, Clonard, Wexford	Available on Project File
Payments & grant draw-down	To assess expenditure and claim recoupment	Available on Project File & Accounts System

Data Availability and Proposed Next Steps

All data appropriate to all stages of this project are available on file

Section B: Evaluation - Step 5: Key Evaluation Questions

The following section looks at the key evaluation questions for the acquisition of 20 no. Turnkey properties at Cluain Beag, Clonard, Wexford, based on the findings from the previous sections of this report.

Does the delivery of the project/programme comply with the standards set out in the Public Spending Code? (Appraisal Stage, Implementation Stage and Post-Implementation Stage)

The delivery of the project complies with the standards set out in the Public Spending Code.

Is the necessary data and information available such that the project/programme can be subjected to a full evaluation at a later date?

There is sufficient data and information available to ensure that the project can be subjected to a full evaluation at a later date.

What improvements are recommended such that future processes and management are enhanced?

There are no recommendations arising from the review of compliance in this case

Section C: Summary and Conclusions

The following section presents a summary of the findings of this In-Depth Check on the acquisition of 20 no. Turnkey properties at Cluain Beag, Clonard, Wexford.

Summary of In-Depth Check

The project documentation for all stages of this project provides satisfactory assurance that there is compliance with the Public Spending Code. Controls upon which reliance can be placed are included in the following documentation:

- Advertisement calling for Expressions of Interest
- Proposal from William Neville & Sons Construction
- Evaluation and Agreement of Proposal
- Independent Valuation Report
- Application to the DHLGH for funding
- Approval from the DHLGH for funding
- Project Execution Plan
- Contracts for Sale/Building Agreements
- Executive Order 827/2020
- HCA 4 Capital Grant Claim Forms
- HCA3 Acquisition of Private Dwellings Forms
- Turnkey Admin Claim Form
- Payments & grant draw-down

APPENDIX C5 – 43 NO. TURNKEY PROPERTIES AT ARD AN BHILE, HEALYSLAND, NEW ROSS

Quality Assurance – In Depth Check

Section A: Introduction

This introductory section details the headline information on the programme or project in question.

Programme or Project Information		
Name	43 no. Turnkey Properties at Ard an Bhile, Healysland, New Ross, Co. Wexford	
Detail	The acquisition on a turnkey basis of 43 no. Turnkey Properties at Ard an Bhile, Healysland, New Ross to help satisfy housing demand in the urban area of New Ross.	
Responsible Body	Wexford County Council	
Current Status	Expenditure Completed	
Start Date	September 2019	
End Date	December 2022	
Overall Cost	€8.59M	

Project Description

The project involved the acquisition of 43 no. Turnkey Properties at Ard an Bhile, Healysland, New Ross, Co. Wexford, following a public advertisement calling for expressions of interest for the supply of social housing, particularly within the urban areas of Wexford, Gorey, Enniscorthy and New Ross where current housing demand is prioritised. The acquisition comprised 12 no. 3-bed semi-detached houses, 2 no. 3-bed semi-detached adaptable houses, 17 no. 2-bed semi-detached houses, 12 no. 2-bed apartments at a total cost of €8,540,000.

Section B: Evaluation - Step 1: Logic Model Mapping

As part of this In-Depth Check, Internal Audit, Wexford County Council has completed a Programme Logic Model (PLM) for the acquisition of 43 no. Turnkey Properties at Ard an Bhile, Healysland, New Ross. A PLM is a standard evaluation tool and further information on their nature is available in the <u>Public Spending Code</u>.

Objectives	Inputs	Activities	Outputs	Outcomes
The provision of a supply of social housing in the New Ross urban area where addressing current housing demand is prioritised	The primary input to the project is the approved funding of €8.75M from the DHLGH	 Public advertisement in local newspapers calling for Expressions of Interest for the Supply of Social Housing Receipt and Evaluation of Proposal Valuation Report Application for funding, including Sustainable Community Proofing, to the DHLGH Approval of DHLGH and Chief Executive to proceed with the acquisition of 43 no. Turnkey Properties 	The delivery of the agreed 43 no. Turnkey units, on a phased basis, as construction was completed	The availability of a supply of 2 and 3 bed social housing units to meet demand in an area where a need was identified

Description of Programme Logic Model

- *Objectives:* The objective was to provide a supply of social housing in the New Ross urban area where current housing demand is prioritised.
- *Inputs:* The primary project input is approved capital funding of €8.75M from the Department of Housing, Local Government & Heritage (DHLGH).
- Activities: Wexford County Council placed an advert in local newspapers in September 2019 calling for expressions of interest for the supply of social housing via turnkey developments, serviced land zoned for residential development and mixed development schemes.

A developer responded with a proposal to deliver 43 turnkey units at Ard an Bhile, Healysland, New Ross.

Wexford County Council's Internal Housing Committee met on 22 November 2019, considered the proposal, and agreed in principle to support the acquisition of 43 turnkey units subject to planning permission, costs, DHLGH approval and contract, having assessed it under the following headings:

- Demand for Social Housing
- Sustainability/Saturation
- Design (Suitability for Social Housing)
- Cost/Value for Money
- Probability of Failure to Deliver
- Ability to Deliver

An Independent Market Valuation was conducted on behalf of Wexford County Council valuing the overall scheme of 43 units at €8,916,000, and valuing the individual house types as follows:

- 3 bed semi detached, type A, 97m2, €235,000
- 3 bed adaptable, type A1, 99m2, €238,000
- 2 bed semi detached type B, 76m2, €200,000
- 2 bed apartment, 76m2, €185,000

An application for funding including Sustainable Community Proofing was submitted to the Department of Housing, Local Government and Heritage (DHLGH).

The DHLGH approved an overall budget of €8,750,000 for the project, including €8,540,000 for the acquisition of 43 no. Housing Units, €170,000 for Legal & Professional Fees and €40,000 for LA Project Management Fee.

The Chief Executive approved the acquisition of 43 no. Turnkey properties at Ard an Bhile, Healysland, New Ross, Co. Wexford

- *Outputs:* The outputs of the project are the delivery of the agreed 43 no. Turnkey units, on a phased basis, as construction was completed.
- *Outcomes:* The outcome of the project is the availability of a supply of 2 and 3-bed social housing units to meet the demand in an area where a need has been identified.

Section B: Evaluation - Step 2: Summary Timeline of Project / Programme Life Cycle

The following section tracks the acquisition of 43 no. Turnkey Properties at Ard an Bhile, Healysland, New Ross from inception to conclusion in terms of major project/programme milestones

September 2019	Public Advertisement calling for Expressions of Interest for the Supply of Social Housing
November 2019	Proposal received from Purcell Properties acting for client Liam Neville Developments Ltd proposing the delivery of turnkey social housing at Ard an Bhile, Healysland, New Ross, Co. Wexford.
November 2019	Evaluation of Proposal to acquire Turnkey Properties at Knockavilla (Ard an Bhile, Healysland), New Ross as a Turnkey acquisition by Internal Housing Committee. Internal Housing Committee agreed in principle subject to planning permission, costs, DHPLG approval and contract to accept proposal for 43 no. Turnkey units.
January 2021	Independent Valuation Report
March 2021	Application for funding including Sustainable Community Proofing submitted to the DHLGH
April 2021	Approval received from the DHLGH for the acquisition of 43 no. Turnkey Properties at Ard an Bhile, Healysland, New Ross, Co. Wexford. Approved budget of €8,750,000 for the project, including €8,540,000 for the acquisition of 43 no. Housing Units, €170,000 for Legal & Professional Fees and €40,000 for LA Project Management Fee.
May 2021	Approval by Chief Executive for the acquisition of 43 no. Turnkey Properties at Ard an Bhile, Healysland, New Ross, Co. Wexford via Turnkey acquisition
October 2021	Combined Contract and Building Agreement exchanged and signed between Liam Neville Developments Ltd and Wexford County Council.
December 2022	Delivery of housing units on a phased basis as construction is completed

Section B: Evaluation - Step 3: Analysis of Key Documents

The following section reviews the key documentation relating to appraisal, analysis, and evaluation for the acquisition of 43 no. Turnkey Properties at Ard an Bhile, Healysland, New Ross, Co. Wexford.

Project/Programme Key Documents	
Title	Details
Advertisement calling for Expressions of Interest	Public Advertisement calling for Expressions of Interest for the Supply of Social Housing in areas where current housing demand is prioritised
Proposal from Liam Neville Developments Ltd	Proposal from Liam Neville Developments Ltd offering 43 no. Turnkey Properties at Ard an Bhile, Healysland, New Ross, Co. Wexford
Evaluation of Proposal	Evaluation of Proposal to acquire 43 no. houses at Ard an Bhile, Healysland, New Ross as a Turnkey acquisition by Internal Housing Committee. Internal Housing Committee agreed to accept proposal.
Valuation Report	Independent Market Valuation conducted on behalf of Wexford County Council valuing the various house types.
Funding Application to the DHLGH	Application for funding including Sustainable Community Proofing submitted to the DHLGH
Funding Approval from the DHLGH	Approval Notification dated 8 April 2021
Project Execution Plan	Project Execution Plan approved 17 May 2021
Executive Order 315/2021	Approval to pay €8,540,000 to Liam Neville Developments Ltd for the acquisition of 43 no. Turnkey Properties at Ard an Bhile, Healysland, New Ross.
Combined Contract and Building Agreement	Combined Contract and Building Agreement between Liam Neville Developments Ltd and Wexford County Council for acquisition of 1-48 Ard an Bhile (43 Turnkey + 5 Part V units)

HCA4 Capital Grant Claim Forms	DHLGH HCA4 Capital Grant Claim Forms and HCA3 Acquisition of Private Dwellings Forms
&	submitted 6 December 2021 (10% deposit on turnkey scheme), and 7, 16 & 21 December
HCA3 Acquisition of Private Dwellings Forms	2022 (for 16, 14 & 13 units respectively), and 23 May 2023 (legal fees for 43 units).
Turnkey Admin Claim Form	DHLGH Turnkey Admin Claim Form submitted 16 December 2022 and 17 May 2023.

Key Document 1: Advertisement calling for Expressions of Interest

A public advertisement in local newspapers on 3 September 2019 calling for expressions of interest for the supply of social housing via turnkey developments and mixed development schemes.

Key Document 2: Proposal from Liam Neville Developments Ltd

Proposal received from Liam Neville Developments Ltd proposing the delivery of houses at Ard an Bhile, Healysland, New Ross.

Key Document 3: Evaluation of Proposal

Wexford County Council's Internal Housing Committee met on 22 November 2019, considered the proposal, and agreed in principle to support the acquisition of 43 turnkey units subject to planning permission, costs, DHPLG approval and contract, having assessed it under the following headings:

- Demand for Social Housing
- Sustainability/Saturation
- Design (Suitability for Social Housing)
- Cost/Value for Money
- Probability of Failure to Deliver
- Ability to Deliver

WCC recommended this acquisition proposal as it

- 1. offers value for money
- 2. adheres with development plan objectives and makes optimum use of land
- 3. achieves social integration
- 4. meets the demand for social housing in the New Ross area.

Key Document 4: Valuation Report

An Independent Market Valuation was conducted on behalf of Wexford County Council valuing the overall scheme of 43 units at €8,916,000, and valuing the individual house types as follows:

- 3 bed semi detached, type A, 97m2, €235,000
- 3 bed adaptable, type A1, 99m2, €238,000
- 2 bed semi detached type B, 76m2, €200,000
- 2 bed apartment, 76m2, €185,000

Key Document 5: Funding Application to the DHLGH

An application for funding including Sustainable Community Proofing was submitted to the Department of Housing, Local Government and Heritage (DHLGH) for approval.

Key Document 6: Funding Approval from the DHLGH

The Approval Notification from the DHLGH, for the acquisition of 43 no. turnkey units is dated 8 April 2021. The DHLGH approved an overall budget of €8,750,000 for the project, including €8,540,000 for the acquisition of 43 no. Housing Units, €170,000 for Legal & Professional Fees and €40,000 for LA Project Management Fee.

Key Document 7: Project Execution Plan

The Project Execution Plan, approved on 17 May 2021 details the Project Brief, Project Phase, Project Development and Implementation Approach, Programme Milestones, Project Cost and Funding Certification.

Key Document 8: Executive Order 315/2021

The Chief Executive approved the payment of €8,540,000 to Liam Neville Developments Ltd for the acquisition of 43 no. Turnkey properties at Ard an Bhile, Healysland, New Ross with Executive Order 315/2021 signed on 17 May 2021.

Key Documents 9: Combined Contract and Building Agreement

Combined Contract and Building Agreement signed between Liam Neville Developments Ltd and Wexford County Council for acquisition of 1-48 Ard an Bhile (43 Turnkey units + 5 Part V units).

Key Documents 10: DHLGH HCA4 Capital Grant Claim Forms, HCA3 Acquisition of Private Dwellings Forms & Turnkey Admin Claim Forms

DHLGH HCA4 Capital Grant Claim Forms and HCA3 Acquisition of Private Dwellings Forms submitted 6 December 2021 (10% deposit on turnkey scheme), and 7, 16 & 21 December 2022 (for 16, 14 & 13 units respectively) and 23 May 2023 (legal fees for 43 units). DHLGH Turnkey Admin Claim Form submitted 16 December 2022 and 17 May 2023. All claims form completed in line with DHLGH budget approval for acquisition of 43 no. Turnkey properties at Ard an Bhile, Healysland, New Ross, vouched legal fees, and LA admin / project management fees.

Section B: Evaluation - Step 4: Data Audit

The following section details the data audit that was carried out for the acquisition of 43 no. Turnkey properties at Ard an Bhile, Healysland, New Ross. It evaluates whether appropriate data is available for the future evaluation of the project/programme.

Data Required	Use	Availability
Evaluation & Agreement of Proposal	To evaluate need, sustainability, suitability, cost, and compliance with public procurement procedures	Available on Project File
Application for funding to the DHLGH	Appraisal of proposed acquisition including independent valuation report and as per requirement for transparency, an explanation of how proposal was selected	Available on Project File
Approval of the DHLGH	To confirm DHLGH formal approval for the acquisition of 43 no. Turnkey properties at Ard an Bhile, Healysland, New Ross	Available on Project File
Executive Order 315/2021	To confirm Wexford County Council's formal approval for the acquisition of 43 no. Turnkey properties at Ard an Bhile, Healysland, New Ross	Available on Project File
Combined Contract and Building Agreements	To assess the nature of the contract and agreement	Available on Project File
Payments & grant draw-down	To assess expenditure and claim recoupment	Available on Project File & Accounts System

Data Availability and Proposed Next Steps

All data appropriate to all stages of this project are available on file.

Section B: Evaluation - Step 5: Key Evaluation Questions

The following section looks at the key evaluation questions for the acquisition of 43 no. Turnkey properties at Ard an Bhile, Healysland, New Ross, based on the findings from the previous sections of this report.

Does the delivery of the project/programme comply with the standards set out in the Public Spending Code? (Appraisal Stage, Implementation Stage and Post-Implementation Stage)

The delivery of the project complies with the standards set out in the Public Spending Code.

Is the necessary data and information available such that the project/programme can be subjected to a full evaluation at a later date?

There is sufficient data and information available to ensure that the project can be subjected to a full evaluation at a later date.

What improvements are recommended such that future processes and management are enhanced?

There are no recommendations arising from the review of compliance in this case

Section C: Summary and Conclusions

The following section presents a summary of the findings of this In-Depth Check on the acquisition of 43 no. Turnkey properties at Ard an Bhile, Healysland, New Ross.

Summary of In-Depth Check

The project documentation for all stages of this project provides satisfactory assurance that there is compliance with the Public Spending Code. Controls upon which reliance can be placed are included in the following documentation:

- Advertisement calling for Expressions of Interest
- Proposal from Liam Neville Developments Ltd
- Evaluation and Agreement of Proposal
- Independent Valuation Report
- Application to the DHLGH for funding
- Approval from the DHLGH for funding
- Project Execution Plan
- Executive Order 315/2021
- Combined Contract and Building Agreement
- HCA 4 Capital Grant Claim Forms
- HCA3 Acquisition of Private Dwellings Forms
- Turnkey Admin Claim Form
- Payments & grant draw-down

APPENDIX C6 – MAINTENANCE OF LOCAL AUTHORITY UNITS

Quality Assurance – In Depth Check

Section A: Introduction

This introductory section details the headline information on the programme or project in question.

Programme or Project Information				
Name	Maintenance of LA Housing Units (Sub-Service A0101 expenditure)			
Detail	Maintenance of LA Housing Units by Wexford County Council			
Responsible Body	Wexford County Council			
Current Status	Expenditure being incurred			
Start Date	January 2022			
End Date	December 2022			
Overall Cost	€4,931,627			

Project Description

The Housing Department in Wexford County Council (WCC) provides and manages rented Local Authority (LA) housing units for those unable to provide housing from their own resources. The Maintenance of LA Housing Units programme is an ongoing programme, with the aim of managing and repairing the Council's rented housing stock to a high standard and carrying out pre-letting repairs on vacant dwellings, to ensure they are relet with minimal delay.

Section B: Evaluation - Step 1: Logic Model Mapping

As part of this In-Depth Check, Internal Audit, Wexford County Council, have completed a Programme Logic Model (PLM) for the **Maintenance of LA Housing Units Programme**. A PLM is a standard evaluation tool and further information on their nature is available in the <u>Public Spending Code</u>.

Objectives	Inputs	Activities	Outputs	Outcomes
To carry out routine housing maintenance & repairs to WCC's housing stock	 Budget Allocation of €4,475,365 	 Tenants requested maintenance & repairs to LA dwellings 	 6,595 repair requests recorded on iHouse system 	 Maintenance & repairs carried out to WCC's housing stock
 housing stock To manage vacant properties & carry out pre-letting improvements/repairs with minimal delay 		 Customer Service Unit recorded maintenance & repairs requests on iHouse system Vacant stock management & pre- letting repairs Tenders advertised to establish new Framework Agreements 	 Pre-letting repairs to 100 housing units Tenders received for Electrical, Plumbing & Painters Frameworks 	 Housing stock maintained to a high standard Vacant dwellings re- let

Description of Programme Logic Model

Objectives: The main objective of the Maintenance of LA Housing Units Programme is to carry out routine housing maintenance and repairs to WCC's housing stock.

The Housing Department WCC is responsible for the management of vacant properties and ensuring pre-letting improvements/repairs are carried out with minimal delay.

- *Inputs:* The primary input to the programme is the budget allocation of €4,475,365.
- Activities: Tenants made requests for maintenance and repairs to their LA dwellings.

The Customer Service Unit (CSU) recorded all maintenance and repairs requests on WCC's iHouse system.

A Senior Executive Engineer was appointed by WCC to manage Housing for all programmes including vacancy and energy improvements. New targets were set to reduce the timeframe to carry out pre-letting repairs (75% completed within 12 weeks).

Tenders were advertised on eTenders to establish Multi-Party Framework Agreements for Electricians, Plumbers, and Painters.

Outputs: The CSU recorded 6,595 repairs requests on WCC's iHouse system.

Pre-letting repairs and allocations were carried out on 100 housing units.

Tenders were received for the Electrical, Plumbing and Painters Frameworks 2023-2026.

Outcomes: Maintenance and repairs are carried out to WCC's housing stock.

WCCs housing stock is maintained to a high standard.

Vacant dwellings are re-let with minimal delay.

Section B: Evaluation - Step 2: Summary Timeline of Project / Programme Life Cycle

The following section tracks the **Maintenance of LA Housing Units Programme** from inception to conclusion in terms of major project/programme milestones.

	Adopted Budget Allocation of €4.48M in 2022	
Jan-Dec 22	Receive request for housing maintenance or repairs	
Jan-Dec 22	CSU enter details of request on iHouse system	
Jan-Dec 22	Task assigned to foreman & details of request are transferred to Geopal	
Jan-Dec 22	Foreman assigns task to Housing Maintenance Crew or Contractor	
Jan-Dec 22	Contractor enters detailed description of works on Geopal & uploads pre and post works photographs	
Jan-Dec 22	Contractor sends in invoice	
Jan-Dec 22	Foreman certifies invoice for payment	
Jan-Dec 22	Housing administrative staff process invoice for payment	
Oct 2022	Tender advertised on eTenders for Housing Minor Building Works Residential, works value €50k-€300k	
Nov 2022	Tender advertised on eTenders for Housing Maintenance Plumbing Framework 2023-2026	
Nov 2022	Tender advertised on eTenders for Housing Maintenance Electrical Contractor Framework 2023-2026	
Nov 2022	Tender advertised on eTenders for Housing Maintenance Painters Framework 2023-2026	
Nov 2022	Response deadline for tenders for Housing Minor Building Works Residential, works value €50k-€300k	
Dec 2022	Response deadline for tenders for Housing Maintenance Plumbing Framework 2023-2026	
Dec 2022	Response deadline for tenders for Housing Maintenance Electrical Contractor Framework 2023-2026	
Jan 2023	Response deadline for tenders for Housing Maintenance Painters Framework 2023-2026	

Section B: Evaluation - Step 3: Analysis of Key Documents

The following section reviews the key documentation relating to appraisal, analysis, and evaluation for the **Maintenance of LA Housing Units Programme**.

Project/Programme Key Documents				
Title	Details			
Budget & Chief Executive's Report 2022	The Adopted Annual Budget 2022 of Wexford County Council			
Wexford County Council Home Maintenance Handbook for Tenants	Guide for tenants of Wexford County Council			
Wexford County Council Public Procurement Policy and Procedures	Public procurement policies and procedures set down by the management of Wexford County Council			
Frameworks	Framework Agreements for Electricians, Plumbers & Painters			
Briefing document for Plumbing Framework 2023	Multi-Party Framework Agreement for Housing Maintenance Plumbing Framework 2023 2026 for Wexford County Council			
Briefing document for Electrical Framework 2023	Multi-Party Framework Agreement for Housing Maintenance Electrical Contractor Framework 2023-2026 for Wexford County Council			
Briefing document for Painters Framework 2023	Multi-Party Framework Agreement for Housing Maintenance Painters Framework 2023- 2026 for Wexford County Council			

Key Document 1: Budget & Chief Executive's Report 2022

The Adopted Annual Budget 2022 of Wexford County Council which includes details on the income and expenditure for the Housing and Building Service in which Maintenance of LA Housing Units Sub-Service A0101 belongs. €4,475,365 was allocated to Maintenance of LA Housing Units Sub-Service A0101 in 2022.

Key Document 2: Wexford County Council Home Maintenance Handbook for Tenants

Handbook provided to tenants of Wexford County Council (WCC) which outlines the following:

- The role and responsibilities of tenants
- The role and responsibilities of WCC
- The services provided by WCC
- What a tenant can and cannot do to the property
- The rules and standards that tenants must accept

Key Document 3: Wexford County Council Public Procurement Policy and Procedures

Document providing the public procurement policies and procedures approved by the Management Team of Wexford County Council (Version 2.03 April 2023).

Key Document 4: Frameworks

- Housing Maintenance Framework of Electricians 2019 2022
- Housing Maintenance Framework of Plumbers 2019 2022
- Wexford Co. Co. Panel of Painting Contractors for Small Works 2018

Key Document 5: Briefing document for Plumbing Framework 2023

Briefing document for Multi-Party Framework Agreement for Housing Maintenance Plumbing Framework 2023-2026 for Wexford County Council.

Key Document 6: Briefing document for Electrical Framework 2023

Briefing document for Multi-Party Framework Agreement for Housing Maintenance Electrical Contractor Framework 2023-2026 for Wexford Council Council.

Key Document 7: Briefing document for Painters Framework 2023

Briefing document for Multi-Party Framework Agreement for Housing Maintenance Painters Framework 2023-2026 for Wexford County Council.

Section B: Evaluation - Step 4: Data Audit

The following section details the data audit that was carried out for the **Maintenance of LA Housing Units Programme**. It evaluates whether appropriate data is available for the future evaluation of the project/programme.

Data Required	Use	Availability
WCC Home Maintenance Handbook for Tenants	To gain an understanding of the tenants' role & responsibilities and WCC's role & responsibilities in relation to the maintenance of LA Housing Units	Made available by the Housing Department
Framework Agreements	To assess Contractor rates	Made available by the Housing Department
Sample of Electrical & Plumbing Contractor Invoices	To assess Contractor invoices against framework agreements	All invoices are available on Council's Accounts System Centros.
Tender briefing documents 2023	Provides evidence of procurement for Contractors	Made available by the Housing Department
Payments	To assess expenditure for the year	All invoices are available on Council's Accounts System Centros

Data Availability and Proposed Next Steps

All data appropriate to the current stage of this project is available on file.

Section B: Evaluation - Step 5: Key Evaluation Questions

The following section looks at the key evaluation questions for the **Maintenance of Local Authority Housing Units Programme** based on the findings from the previous sections of this report.

Does the delivery of the project/programme comply with the standards set out in the Public Spending Code? (Appraisal Stage, Implementation Stage and Post-Implementation Stage)

The Maintenance of Local Authority Housing Units Programme forms part of Wexford County Council's annual current expenditure programme. While the 2022 programme involved spending of €4.93M, the value of individual contracts was limited, and none exceeded €500,000.

Procurement practices in this area were reviewed as part of this in-depth review. There was insufficient evidence of compliance with the Public Spending Code in the invoices reviewed. On that basis only limited assurance can be provided. However, it is noted that during 2022, the Housing Maintenance team undertook a complete restructuring of the framework agreements informing the delivery of services in the housing maintenance area. This work is continuing in 2023 with adjustments to incorporate the requirements of DPER Circular 05/2023: Initiatives to assist SMEs in Public Procurement. Frameworks are now in place for plumbing, electrical works, painting and Housing Minor Building Works Residential (works value €50k-€300k) for the period 2023-2026.

Corporate Purchasing Card payments by Housing Maintenance staff were also reviewed. The transactions and documents reviewed indicate compliance with the Public Spending Code.

Is the necessary data and information available such that the project/programme can be subjected to a full evaluation at a later date?

All data appropriate to the current stage of the project is available on file.

What improvements are recommended such that future processes and management are enhanced?

It is recommended that the 2023-2026 framework agreements and other procurement improvements being put in place by the Housing Maintenance team are fully documented and implemented to comply with the Public Spending Code. It is further recommended that the Housing Maintenance Programme be reviewed again as part of the Public Spending Code Quality Assurance process in 2024.

The following section presents a summary of the findings of this In-Depth Check on the Maintenance of LA Housing Units Programme.

Summary of In-Depth Check

The programme documentation provides limited assurance that there is compliance with the Public Spending Code. Controls upon which reliance can be placed include:

- Home Maintenance Handbook for tenants
- Adopted Annual Budget 2022
- Framework Agreements
- Tender documents & assessments
- iHouse System & Geopal
- Council's Accounts System (Centros)